Chords or Melody? Which came first?

It would be interesting to have the composers of these tunes at a seminar of some kind to ask them a few questions: "When you wrote these songs, were you sitting at the piano or doodling on a guitar? Did you first come up with the chord progression and then weave the melody to suit? Did you have a melody in mind and then come up with the chord structure?" (More at the bottom of the second page.)





Even without having an answer from any of these famous song writers, I would guess that the chords came first and the melody was woven into that structure. There of course is the chance that the chords and melody took shape more or less simultaneously.

However, the point is that the melodies contain more basic chordal tones than anything else but there probably is more scale wise motion from one melody note to the next as compared to arpeggiated leaps. Extremely long melodic leaps tend to be in places where one phrase ends and the next one begins. None of these observations are written rules for composition but are useful when creating a solo. I would recommend studying full versions of dozens of tunes (or more) to observe what good song writers have done in the past. Any good fake book will be an excellent source of material. Pay attention to things such as melody note to suggested chord relationship. Also note, that good songs generally have a fair amount of thematic repetition. Repetition might come in the form of rhythm but with new melody notes and harmony. Repetition of an idea is needed to give the listener something to hang on to. Make note of how songwriters have used melodic inharmonics such as passing tones, auxiliaries, appogiaturas and such.

The previous lessons in this book have suggested all of these ideas and the last few lessons had extended arpeggiated elements. The next lesson has some arpeggiated elements which are smoothed out and maybe disguised by passing melodic elements. There is always the danger that what will emerge from this process might simply sound like connected scales.

The first few song excerpts have the beginings of some basic melodic analysis. Continue this process with songs of your own choosing.