Understanding Historical Perspectives in Political Philosophy:

An Examination of the Works of Leanne Betasamosake Simpson and Nancy Fraser

Name: Mollie Schnurr Student Number: 0692925 Professor: Nadine Changfoot Course: POST 4505 Date: April 14th, 2023

While neither Leanne Betasamosake Simpson nor Nancy Fraser are philosophers that deal directly with the question of history, or how history should be understood, the way they understand history significantly impacts their respective worldviews. Betasamosake Simpson offers a Nishnaabeg perspective on the past, while Fraser offers a liberal feminist perspective on the past. These perspectives cannot be brought together to create one worldview. Additionally, it is unfair to take the understandings of each of these authors and twist them to create a combined view of history. However, examining both conceptions in the context of one another offers value, as it provides an understanding of how the past can be conceptualized differently, and examining events through both perspectives separately can provide a more well-rounded perspective on history and historical events. The purpose of this research is to examine the historical methodology behind their arguments, rather than assess the arguments themselves. This essay will begin with an examination of each theorist's perspective on history and will then move to analyze these perspectives in the context of each other. It will argue that while combining these conceptions of history into one understanding is not productive, each can be utilized to answer different historical questions.

While Betasamosake Simpson and Fraser offer interesting perspectives on Indigenous philosophy and feminism respectively, their views on history will be examined separately from the arguments within their writing. Neither theorist directly addresses their methodology regarding history. Thus, this essay will deal with their writings on other subjects and will determine from the language used within these the historical methodology each writer is using. Sources from each author will be used to pull specific examples as well as overall themes within their writing related to their perspectives on historical methodology. For both theorists, five sources were selected. For Betasamosake Simpson these included; *As We Have Always Done*, Land as Pedagogy: Nishnaabeg Intelligence and Rebellious Transformation, A Short History of the Blockade: Giant Beavers, Diplomacy, and Regeneration in Nishnaabewin, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back : Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence, and Rehearsals for Living/areyoureallysureyouwanttobewell. For Fraser these include Feminism, Capitalism, and the Cunning of History, Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence, Tales from the Trenches: On Women Philosophers, Feminist Philosophy, and the Society for Phenomenology and Existential Philosophy, A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi, and Feminist Politics in the Age of Recognition: A Two-Dimensional Approach to Gender Justice. These sources were chosen as they are more recent writings from each of these authors, and they each deal, to some degree, with the past and history. While neither of these authors are writing directly on their conceptions of history, their understandings of history and the past can be examined through their writing on other subjects.

## Leanne Betasamosake Simpson's Understanding of History

Leanne Betasamosake Simpson is a Michi Saagiig Nishnaabeg writer.<sup>1</sup> Using Nishnaabeg intellectual practices she writes on Indigenous resurgence, politics, and stories.<sup>2</sup> She uses an understanding of history that is grounded in Nishnaabeg thought and practices.

Firstly, she believes that history is based on connections to nature, narratives, stories, and oral traditions. Fraser talks in most of her writings about how a child, or how she, learned Nishnaabeg histories, traditions and ways of knowing. There is a particular focus in *Land as Pedagogy* on land-based learning. This is told through the story of Kwezens who learns from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, "About," https://www.leannesimpson.ca/about.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, "About."

nature around her.<sup>3</sup> In *As We Have Always Done* Betasamosake Simpson herself learns from the world around her.<sup>4</sup> In both of these stories, the land and nature provide a basis from which they can learn history, the past, and connect themselves to it. She argues that a person acquires knowledge through stories and their connections to the land and their families.<sup>5</sup> It is through this that a person acquires an understanding of history and the past.

However, these are not just tellings of the nature-based experiences of others.

Betasamosake Simpson uses these examples as stories to communicate her perspectives to her audience. Thus, history continues to be communicated. She views people as storytellers, and stories as an effective way of transmitting the information.<sup>6</sup> Rather than history being a series of facts and dates, history is a story or experience connected to the present-day world. These stories and traditions connect learners to the past, their ancestors, and nature.<sup>7</sup> Through this, they are also connected to the future.

Betasamosake Simpson sees history as something that is interconnected with the past and future. This is best typified by her discussion around her great-grandmother and great-grandchildren. Betasamosake Simpson sees herself, and all people, as a "link in a chain."<sup>8</sup> She views herself as a link in the chain between her ancestors, and future generations. She states that the Nishnaabeg conceptualize time as ongoing rather than linear.<sup>9</sup> She views time as non-linear, not passing through past, present, and future as distinct phases, but rather as circular

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, "Land as Pedagogy: Nishnaabeg Intelligence and Rebellious Transformation," *Decolonizing Indigeneity, Education and Society*, 3, no. 3 (2014): 6,

https://jps.library.utoronto.ca/index.php/des/article/view/22170.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, "Introduction," *As We Have Always Done*, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2017), 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, *A Short History of the Blockade: Giant Beavers, Diplomacy, and Regeneration in Nishnaabewin,* (Edmonton, Alberta: University of Alberta Press, 2021), 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, A Short History of the Blockade: Giant Beavers, Diplomacy, and Regeneration in Nishnaabewin, 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, *Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence,* (Winnipeg: Arbeiter Ring Publishing, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, "Introduction," 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, "Land as Pedagogy: Nishnaabeg Intelligence and Rebellious Transformation," 8.

and continuous. She also sees a form of responsibility within this circular perception of time. She says that ancestors took seeds of culture and political systems and packed them away so another generation might be able to plant them.<sup>10</sup> Then, the current generation has a responsibility to plant and nurture seeds for future generations.<sup>11</sup> This shows a degree of responsibility for the generations which follow and a strong feeling of respect for preceding generations. Showing the interconnectedness between the past, present, and future generations.

Next, she demonstrates history as continuous. This is in contrast to a view of history that operates in discrete phases, or that is relegated to the past. One way that this is done is through her understanding of the United States' election. Classical historical methods often divide periods by who is in political power at the time. Betasamosake Simpson, however, sees this change in administration as the continuation of trends of the past that involve power and oppression.<sup>12</sup> This demonstrates the continuation of themes which may have been otherwise deemed simply historical, into the present.

This demonstrates how history is not simply things that happened in the past, with the implication that they are no longer happening, but rather it is a continuous process with themes and structures. This is exemplified throughout her writing when she refers to colonialism. Colonialism has had and continues to have significant impacts on Indigenous people. Betasamosake Simpson does not separate the impacts of colonialism in the past from the impacts on the present.<sup>13</sup> This demonstrates how colonialism continues today, but also shares the same structures as it had in the past. She also connects histories of resistance and dispossession to their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Robyn Maynard and Leanne Betasamosake Simpson, "Part Six: Rehearsals for

Living/areyoureallysureyouwanttobewell," Rehearsals for Living. (Toronto: Knopf Canada, 2022), 181.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence.

current manifestations. She writes of events of the past, including the 1923 Williams Treaty, and connects this with current forms of land dispossession.<sup>14</sup> Through this, she understands the past as having continuing structures and themes. These are not past events replicated in the present but are themes continued from the past into the present. This approach avoids a relegation of the events of the past to the past but rather examines how similar events continue and manifest today.

Betasamosake Simpson does not view history as a force unto itself that people need to support or resist, but rather she views it as simply a period that people pass through. She says that the goals of Indigenous people "have been consistent throughout history: to restore balance, justice and good health to our lands and our peoples and to have good relations with settler governments and peoples based on respect for our sovereignty, independence and jurisdiction over our territories."<sup>15</sup> This quote demonstrates how Betasamosake Simpson centres agency within history. She does not talk about people resisting the forces of history, or an abstract notion of the community having values. Rather, she centres people and their individual and collective goals. This supports the idea that history itself does not have goals or stages or pressures, but rather it is a period of time in which people had goals, thoughts and dreams. Additionally, she views people in the past as always having agency. She discusses how her ancestors continually participated in world-building as a form of resistance to colonial pressures.<sup>16</sup> In this, history is not an abstract power bearing down on people, but rather a period in which events occurred that people resisted.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, "Land as Pedagogy: Nishnaabeg Intelligence and Rebellious Transformation," 21.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Maynard and Betasamosake Simpson, "Part Six: Rehearsals for Living/areyoureallysureyouwanttobewell," 182.

Finally, Betasamosake Simpson does not believe in an end of history but rather views it as a continuing process. History is circular, connected to the past and future. This is not a reductive view which would involve equating the past with the present, but rather it is connective. Betasamosake Simpson understands that there were differences in life pre-colonial contact and throughout different times during colonialism.<sup>17</sup> In particular, she recognizes a degree of idyllicism in the past in comparison to the colonial and industrialized present.<sup>18</sup> She also recognizes that time moves in an upwards direction, utilizing dates, and words such as past, present and future. There is a recognition of a passage and change of time, but a continuation of culture, stories, and themes. She divides the past by major events which affected the Nishnaabeg, but these events are seen as leading into one another, and from a lens of their interconnectedness with past, present and future.<sup>19</sup> Additionally, this comparison of an idyllic past to a non-idyllic future conveys a sense of urgency of resurgence.<sup>20</sup> This would involve working to restore the "seeds" of the past that the ancestors preserved.<sup>21</sup> This further contributes to the connection of the past with the present and future.

This future has no determined endpoint. She says that the remaking of the world will never be done.<sup>22</sup> Instead, Betasamosake Simpson views the future as one of continuous movement and resistance, one driven by the future generations, to which there is a responsibility.<sup>23</sup> This further speaks to a non-linear and non-ending history. While Betasamosake

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, A Short History of the Blockade: Giant Beavers, Diplomacy, and Regeneration in Nishnaabewin, 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, "Introduction," 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, "Introduction," 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Maynard and Betasamosake Simpson, "Part Six: Rehearsals for Living/areyoureallysureyouwanttobewell," 186.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Betasamosake Simpson, Dancing on Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence.

Simpson has a recognition that there are events of the past, classically referred to as history, history is not relegated to the past. Rather, history continues into the present and future.

# Nancy Fraser's Understanding of History

Nancy Fraser is an American politics and philosophy professor specializing in feminist theory.<sup>24</sup> Much of her writing included in this essay focuses on feminism and in particular the philosophical history of feminism and the phases which it has gone through in modern history. Fraser's approach to history is markedly different from that of Betasamosake Simpson. This approach is not oppositional, as it does not engage with or disagree with Betasamosake Simpson's perspective on history directly, but it is substantively different from Betasamosake Simpson's understanding of the past.

Fraser understands history as something that occurs in acts, phases, eras or generations. Each of these terms varies in meaning, but they all imply a division and segmenting of history. These categories all relate to specific periods of the past which are distinct from each other, have defined start and end points, and have specific characteristics. For example, she discusses how there can be a zeitgeist of an era, which means the spirit or mood of that period.<sup>25</sup> Each of the acts leads into the next but they are distinct in some way.<sup>26</sup> Fraser most clearly lays out these divisions in *Feminism, Capitalism, and the Cunning of History*. This article outlines a historical account of second-wave feminism dividing periods of feminist history into one of three "acts".<sup>27</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The New School for Social Research, "Nancy Fraser," Faculty,

https://www.newschool.edu/nssr/faculty/Nancy-Fraser/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Nancy Fraser, "Feminist Politics in the Age of Recognition: A Two-Dimensional Approach to Gender Justice," *Studies in Social Justice* 1, no. 1 (2007): 23, https://doi.org/10.26522/ssj.v1i1.979.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Nancy Fraser, "Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence," *The South Atlantic Quarterly* 114, no. 4 (2015): 701, https://doi.org/10.1215/00382876-3157089.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Nancy Fraser, "Feminism, Capitalism, and the Cunning of History," *HAL Open Science*. August 2012, 4. https://newleftreview-org.proxy1.lib.trentu.ca/issues/ii56/articles/nancy-fraser-feminism-capitalism-and-the-cunning -of-history.

Each of the acts in this article contains specific characteristics that the preceding and following acts do not contain.

As each phase of history is distinct, this demonstrates history's linear nature for Fraser. Each act follows the other, presenting the forward progression of history. While themes can be carried over between each of Fraser's defined periods, the periods still do serve to segment history. In *Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence* Fraser continues this linear perspective by arguing that second-wave feminism has a legacy.<sup>28</sup> The word "legacy" indicates that this is a non-continuous period. While second-wave feminism is no longer occurring, its impacts do continue. Additionally, these periods are interconnected through ideas. For example, ideas regarding critical feminism and emancipation can be revived.<sup>29</sup> As well, ideas can be "resurrected from the historical dustbin."<sup>30</sup> This word choice shows how Fraser does not understand one period as the continuation of the last, but rather focuses on them as individual periods which may have some shared ideological or thematic connections.

Fraser also understands history as a force. She indicates that history is more than the passive passing of time, rather it is a force unto itself. She writes of a "historical wave."<sup>31</sup> This shows history as a force which impacts the events that occur. This, however, does not negate human agency; rather, history is a force that people can resist or support. She uses phrases such as "broader historical forces.<sup>32</sup> As well as "energies of an era."<sup>33</sup> These two quotes indicate that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Fraser, "Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence," 700.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Nancy Fraser, "Feminism, Capitalism, and the Cunning of History," 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Fraser, "Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence," 702.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Nancy Fraser, "Tales from the Trenches: On Women Philosophers, Feminist Philosophy, and the Society for Phenomenology and Existential Philosophy," *The Journal of Speculative Philosophy* 26, no. 2 (2012): 180, https://doi.org/10.5325/jspecphil.26.2.0175.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Fraser, "Tales from the Trenches: On Women Philosophers, Feminist Philosophy, and the Society for Phenomenology and Existential Philosophy," 183.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Fraser, "Tales from the Trenches: On Women Philosophers, Feminist Philosophy, and the Society for Phenomenology and Existential Philosophy," 184.

history is more than merely passive and has a force and energy. Additionally, it presents history as a force that people can support, or resist.

Understanding history as a force also lends it a sense of inevitability. Regarding this, Fraser discusses Weber's theory that Calvinism jump-started capitalism.<sup>34</sup> This jump-start theory implies that the conditions for capitalism existed as a result of forces of history, and thus to a degree, capitalism was inevitable. However, she does not believe that history is entirely predetermined. She argues that feminists are active participants in the making of history.<sup>35</sup> Charismatic individuals can also impact the course of history.<sup>36</sup> However, in these examples while charismatic individuals and feminists play an active role in shaping history, it is phased as if history was on a path which the people then took the agency to shift or change. This is through words such as "rejecting" an undescribed dominating power.<sup>37</sup> This is also shown through the phrase "a charismatic individual can indeed make a difference to the course of history".<sup>38</sup> These two examples both place history as a force alone, and not driven by a named power. Thus, history is a power unto itself that individuals with agency can then resist against. This demonstrates history as a force, and somewhat inevitable.

Fraser also offers a homogenous view of history. Throughout her articles, Fraser understands history, which she does not geographically limit, as a unified experience of the past. One example of this is in her use of the phrase "post-war era".<sup>39</sup> While it is often widely assumed that this phrase refers to the period after World War Two, there have been many wars and thus many post-war eras. The use of this phrase, without explanation of which war she is specifically

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Fraser, "Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence," 708.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Fraser, "Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence," 705.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Nancy Fraser, "A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi," New Left Review 81, no. 81 (2013): 123, https://newleftreview-org.proxy1.lib.trentu.ca/issues/ii81/articles/nancy-fraser-a-triple-movement. <sup>37</sup> Fraser, "Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence," 705.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Fraser, "A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi," 123.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Fraser, "A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi," 130.

referring to, suggests that all readers have a homogenous view of history which aligns with Fraser's and understands this phrase in the same way. Furthermore, she uses the phrase "cultural turn".<sup>40</sup> With this phrase, again, she fails to limit the scope of what she is referring to. Instead, she uses the word "culture" broadly, indicating a sort of global culture.<sup>41</sup> This phrase also demonstrates how she understands culture to be experienced in a similar way by all people. Fraser does not limit her arguments around history to a specific group or culture, but rather expands them to include all people. This understanding makes the past and history out to be a similar and homogenous experience for all.

Fraser also understands history in a weighted way, with certain acts being deemed more important. For example, in *A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi*, she uses the phrase "second great transformation."<sup>42</sup> The phrasing of this is incredibly important. Firstly, she notes that it is a "great transformation."<sup>43</sup> This indicates a sense of weight applied to certain transformations, denoting some as great, while others do not receive this label. This demonstrates how she understands some events to take importance. Additionally, she uses the word "second."<sup>44</sup> This implies that there has only been one previous transformation. This minimizes the importance of other transformations that may have occurred to give preference to these two specific transformations. She also says that she "had the luck to come along at this point in history."<sup>45</sup> This shows history to be something that has had what Fraser deemed to have good and bad times in which to be born. Rather than understanding history as simply the passage

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Fraser, "Feminist Politics in the Age of Recognition: A Two-Dimensional Approach to Gender Justice," 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Fraser, "Feminist Politics in the Age of Recognition: A Two-Dimensional Approach to Gender Justice," 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Fraser, "A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi," 120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Fraser, "A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi," 120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Fraser, "A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi," 120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Fraser, "Tales from the Trenches: On Women Philosophers, Feminist Philosophy, and the Society for Phenomenology and Existential Philosophy," 180.

of time, this understanding of the past as weighted shows how she makes judgements on good or bad times in history, as well as what events in the past are most important.

# Analysis of Betasamosake Simpson and Fraser's Historical Methodologies

Betasamosake Simpson and Fraser offer very different perspectives on history and the past. Betasamosake Simpson offers a historical perspective rooted in Nishnaabeg thinking, which views history as interconnected to the present and future, and a continuous movement of time. Comparatively, Fraser offers a perspective on history rooted in her understanding of feminist history and understands the past in discrete phases and history as a weighted force. While very different, each of these conceptions of history and the past offers value to students and scholars of political philosophy and history as both of their conceptions aim to answer different historical questions.

Betasamosake Simpson's conception of history aims to answer the question of how the past impacts the present, and how the present impacts future generations' past. As such, her theory is focused on history as circular, with themes and ideas being continuous. There is also an emphasis on how history is taught. This question is valuable in understanding this interconnectedness between past, present, and future, as well as in teaching the current generation to care for preceding and following generations.

The question that Betasamosake Simpson is trying to answer is rooted in the purpose of her theories. She is focusing on Indigenous peoples, particularly the Nishnaabeg people, and resurgence. As such, understanding history as circular, and based on care is important for building theories of resurgence. This conception of history forces students of Betasamosake Simpson to understand the ways in which their present was created, appreciate the effort that

went into creating their present and the care that their ancestors had for them, and in turn care for the following generations. This is very important for resurgence efforts, which focus on a type of reclaiming of pre-colonial ideals in order to create a better present and future for Indigenous peoples. Betasamosake Simpson's view of history as circular prevents her students from placing Indigenous history in phases which can then be disregarded, or seen as not impactful on the present. Additionally, it encourages them to continue to care for the generations beyond the current ones.

While Betasamosake Simpson is focusing specifically on Indigenous resurgence with her conception of history, this methodology has the potential to be expanded, with credit and respect, to non-Indigenous histories. Understanding connections to, and having care for, the past and the future in the present is a valuable way of understanding the present and how it occurred, as well as creating a better future.

Fraser's conception of history aims to answer the question, what happened in the past, and how did certain themes change over time? As such, most of her historical methodology focuses on segmenting the past into easy-to-understand acts, eras, or generations. These segments of the past can then be examined in depth, and connections, themes, or trends that have been revealed can also be examined. This historical methodology can be valuable in creating divisions for easy study and understanding. Additionally, it can be used to create generalizations about the past and history, which can be used to support argumentative goals and create baseline understandings of events.

This conception of history is rooted in Fraser's use of the past and historical events in feminism. Fraser's theories discuss the history of feminism, and how feminism has developed throughout history. Thus, she is able to draw on pre-existing divisions of history, such as first,

second, and third-wave feminism, as well as create her own divisions. By examining these divisions, she can understand the progression of feminism in the world, and how current structures came to be. Understanding history in this way allows for students of Fraser to understand the progression of these events. It also encourages them to break down complicated histories into smaller, more manageable study components in order to create themes and arguments around their histories.

While Fraser is focusing on feminism specifically, her theories have the potential to be easily expanded to other movements throughout time. This segmentation and division of history could be used to study any resistance movement, or large theme in society. It is very useful in understanding how certain events come to be, and change throughout history.

While these two theories should not be collapsed into each other to create a third historical methodology which is a mix of the two theories, they do both hold value, and one theory is not better than the other. While combining should be avoided, they have the potential to be used consecutively. One application for this could be using both theorists to examine Indigenous resurgence movements. Betasamosake Simpson's methodology could be used to examine theories behind resurgence, and what is being taught regarding resurgence as well as create propositions for how history and the past should be taught. Fraser's methodology could be applied to examine specific events within Indigenous resistance and resurgence movements, examining how specific movements and groups form, and how their ideologies and methods have progressed.

With this use, efforts should be made to mitigate the effects of potential weaknesses emerging from Fraser's methodology which homogenizes the past. Fraser's theory has a tendency to homogenize experiences in order to create clear divisions between periods and

themes throughout history. While this homogenization and division are useful in simplifying understandings of the past and viewing themes, it does ignore variance in experiences between individuals. While Fraser's methodology does have valuable applications care should be taken to recognize the limitations of this homogenizing methodology. Additionally, a weighing of events as more or less important or influential may be unjust in examining Indigenous movements and people. Betasamosake Simpson would understand the past, and the events that occurred, in an unweighted way. Fraser's efforts to compare events to determine value may therefore not be appreciated within studies of Indigenous resurgence.

Despite limitations, Fraser's methodology does have the ability to simplify the past in order to develop an understanding of what occurred. This approach to history and the past could be seen as a good starting point for study, but should not be the only approach which is taken, as there are significant limitations. By also examining history through the methodology introduced by Betasamosake Simpson, a more complete understanding of the past, present, and future will be gained. A consecutive use of these theories could provide a more well-rounded, and complete understanding of history and the past as both can be used to answer different historical questions.

#### Conclusion

The writings of Betasamosake Simpson and Fraser reveal a great deal about their conceptions of history and the past. Their writings reveal, through the language and structures of thought they use their respective historical methodologies. Understanding their historical methodology has two main purposes. Firstly, as it functions as a base for their arguments, it is important to understand how they conceptualize the past and history in order to understand from where their ideas emerge. Secondly, the historical methodologies which they employ are

interesting and have the capability to be utilized by other political philosophers, with credit. While these conceptions are very different, and should not be combined, they offer a foundation for which students of political philosophy might understand both the impact of the past on the present, and the present on the future, as well as what happened in the past and how this has changed over time. If the methodologies provided by Betasamosake Simpson and Fraser are applied to the questions that these political philosophers are intending to answer, and with care to the limitations of these methodologies, there is significant potential for new philosophical arguments to be created based on the historical methodology of these two authors.

## Bibliography

Betasamosake Simpson, Leanne. "About." https://www.leannesimpson.ca/about.

- Betasamosake Simpson, Leanne. A Short History of the Blockade: Giant Beavers, Diplomacy, and Regeneration in Nishnaabewin. Edmonton, Alberta: University of Alberta Press, 2021.
- Betasamosake Simpson, Leanne. Dancing on Our Turtle's Back : Stories of Nishnaabeg
  Re-Creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence. Winnipeg: Arbeiter Ring Publishing,
  2011.
- Betasamosake Simpson, Leanne. "Introduction." *As We Have Always Done*. 1-10. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2017.
- Betasamosake Simpson, Leanne. "Land as Pedagogy: Nishnaabeg Intelligence and Rebellious Transformation." *Decolonizing Indigeneity, Education and Society*, 3, no. 3 (2014): 1-25. https://jps.library.utoronto.ca/index.php/des/article/view/22170.
- Fraser, Nancy. "A Triple Movement?: Parsing the Politics of Crisis after Polanyi." *New Left Review* 81, no. 81 (2013): 119–132.
  - https://newleftreview-org.proxy1.lib.trentu.ca/issues/ii81/articles/nancy-fraser-a-triple-m ovement.
- Fraser, Nancy. "Feminism, Capitalism, and the Cunning of History." *HAL Open Science*. August 2012. 1-14.

https://newleftreview-org.proxy1.lib.trentu.ca/issues/ii56/articles/nancy-fraser-feminism-capitalism-and-the-cunning-of-history.

Fraser, Nancy. "Feminism's Two Legacies: A Tale of Ambivalence." *The South Atlantic Quarterly* 114, no. 4 (2015): 699–712. https://doi.org/10.1215/00382876-3157089.

Fraser, Nancy. "Tales from the Trenches: On Women Philosophers, Feminist Philosophy, and the Society for Phenomenology and Existential Philosophy." *The Journal of Speculative Philosophy* 26, no. 2 (2012): 175–184. https://doi.org/10.5325/jspecphil.26.2.0175.

Fraser, Nancy. "Feminist Politics in the Age of Recognition: A Two-Dimensional Approach to Gender Justice." *Studies in Social Justice* 1, no. 1 (2007): 23–35. https://doi.org/10.26522/ssj.v1i1.979.

Maynard, Robyn and Leanne Betasamosake Simpson. "Part Six: Rehearsals for Living/areyoureallysureyouwanttobewell." *Rehearsals for Living*. 167-187. Toronto: Knopf Canada, 2022.

The New School for Social Research. "Nancy Fraser." Faculty. https://www.newschool.edu/nssr/faculty/Nancy-Fraser/.