

Course Introduction

Seminar Meeting - 09/09/2021

1. Office hours on zoom
2. No TAs - will be a marker/grader
3. No research in course
4. Essay style assignments
5. Attendance is taken in seminar, participation mark here
6. Ober - what is a democracy, what is it not

Week 2 - Imagining "Equality"

Selections from the Athenian Constitution

1. Country was an oligarchy, as the country was in the hands of a few people
2. Solon liberated the people by prohibiting loans on the security of the person, and he cancels all debts
3. He incurred the hostility of all pirates
4. He divided the population into four classes
5. The courts had to decide in all matters, public and private
6. Solon then set out on a journey to Egypt
7. When Solon left they were unable to elect an archon
8. People put their faith in Cleisthenes
9. He created even more democratic reforms

Athenian Law protecting the areopagus in the event of a plot against the democracy

1. Whoever rises up in tyranny will be undefiled
2. If democracy is overthrown they cannot go and sit in the areopagus

1.3

1. Do not allow sovereign power to revert back to monarchs
2. Then there was a debate on government
3. Persons believed that all personnel should share in government
 - a. Monarch can do whatever he wants unchecked
4. Equality before the law is good as it is not guilty of the excesses of monarchy
5. Some people believe that democracy was a violent and ignorant mob
6. Monarchy develops naturally
7. Question of where do we get our freedom from and who gives it to us

The original meaning of democracy - Josiah Ober

1. Democracy has a root meaning of the power of the people
2. Modern democracy means voting rule determining the will of the majority
3. If democracy was reduced to its voting rule, and voting rule is flawed, then so is democracy
4. Democracy refers to power as in the capacity to do things
5. Arché root terms seem to be concerned with the monopoly of office, or how many people can occupy official positions of power
6. Kratos means the power to do things, so all who are equal would then share in this power
7. There is difficulty in creating collective action and coordinating this

Lecture - Imagining Equality

1. Equality was not pre existing - before there was a hierarchical society
2. Political imagination is supported by the desire for emancipation and quality the ability to dream beyond a living nightmare
3. Oligarchy - rule by the few landowners
4. Democracy came to exist through a lot of thinking about it and striving for it

Imagining "Equality"

1. Athenian democracy tried to have equality, but only equality between athenian born men who owned property
2. Each imagining can block other political possibilities
3. Athenian democracy imagined equality while also repudiating principles of inequality and exclusion
4. Athenians were largely a hybrid culture, and did not invent democracy

Our political heritage

1. 16th century the was the idea that democracy came from the athenians, where it actually came from turkey
2. We think of western culture having come from greece
3. The sense of the west is a social construct

Political Life and the Polis

1. Political life was organized around the polis
2. Self Governing political community containing rural, urban areas and and agora
3. Citizens lived and participated in a very public life though they were incorporated into its customs, laws, decisions, habits etc
4. The polis possessed a slave community and it was based on a slave economy
 - a. This allowed them the spare time to go hang out in the polis
5. Athenian men largely spent their time in the agora talking to each other
6. They spent a lot of time participating in the cultural aspects of the community
7. Being part of the polis was part of who they were

Politics

1. Moderns think of politics of having a specific meaning
2. For liberalism politics is instrumental
3. We are individuals first, society and politics is something we can choose to belong to but largely exists outside of ourselves
4. The polis was a complete ethic
5. They thought that politics was what separates us from humans
 - a. Once you gain freedom from working for your needs you gain freedom to think

Elite Rule and Stasis in the Athenian Polis

Athenians between 900-600 bce

1. Period of population, growth, prosperity
2. Mixes a bit with the dark ages
3. With the growth of prosperity we also get a growth of inequality
4. Aristocracy of the eupatridae ("those born from noble fathers") emerged
5. The foundation of the polis lay in the oikos or household
 - a. Polis was a combination of a bunch of households/families

- b. It was divided among patriarchal lines
- 6. Powerful aristocratic families formed into “tribes” that divided the polis
- 7. Athens lacked a formal legal system and justice was a matter of personal honour

Last King

- 1. Athens disposed of its last king around 700 bce
- 2. Power fell to the aristocracy, through the areopagus council
- 3. Commoners had no power and were fighter impoverished by the land system and debt bondage
- 4. This was an oligarchy, as the ruling families were land-owning families
- 5. Aristotle and the athenian constitution says that in this era - the rich “owned” the poor and their children - they had a lot of debt bondage
- 6. Growth of a non-noble elite the kakoi
- 7. Athens fell into a state of stairs or conflict as a result of blood feuds
- 8. Emergence of a new type of politician (a legislator) and impartial citizens who steps in to try to stop the civil war through re-organizing the institutions

Draco's Reforms

- 1. Draco steps in the role of legislator in 621 BCE
- 2. Establishes the first written legal codes and constitutions
 - a. Gave the law to all citizens and they could use the laws to try to protect themselves
- 3. Draco is where the term draconian comes from
 - a. Death sentence for petty crimes
 - b. Further instituted debt bondage
- 4. Draco's reforms increased inequality and stasis
- 5. Basically codified class privileges

Solon's Reforms

- 1. Appointed in 594 BCE
- 2. Forgave debts, eliminated the institution of debt bondage, redistribution of wealth
- 3. Established a stasis law - whenever there is a conflict you have to pick a side
 - a. Believed that everyone has a share in the city, so everyone needs to be involved in the affairs of the city
- 4. Rewrote legal codes to be more moderate and to eliminate class privileges
- 5. Reformed the constitution to establish athens as a politea - a mixed constitutional regime, mix between democracy and oligarchy
- 6. If everyone owned a little bit of land they did not have to get into debt
- 7. Created a more accessible legal system
- 8. Creates 4 different census categories based on wealth
 - a. Doesn't matter if you are noble born or not, matters how much money you have
 - b. The more money you have the better political posts you can get
- 9. Lower classes get a little bit more civic responsibility
- 10. Establishes form of election - election by vote and election by lot
 - a. This allows people who are not as charismatic or rich to be in power
- 11. Only some positions are by lot
 - a. Most of these are the positions that got to the lowest social categories

12. At this time athens had coalesced into 4 tribes
13. Created the council of 400, a ruling council in the city that had equal representation for all 4 tribes

Athenian Citizenship

1. Citizens were free men who could not be sold into slavery
2. Lower class citizens could not define themselves in distinctions between slaves
3. This prevented the lower class from aligning themselves with slaves and overthrowing the rich
4. Established order by creating a common citizens base
5. Solon's reforms were not democratic, emphasized unity of citizens, re-inscribed elite rule
6. Solon's reforms created 4 years of temporary stability before stasis set in again

Pisistratus's Reforms

1. Pisistratus was a tyrant (not elected, ceases power), not a legislator, but he appealed directly to the lower classes
2. He rules in a constitutional and moderate way
3. The exiles a bunch of rich people and gives their land to the poor
4. Offered loans and established rural courts
5. Created a tax system
6. Offers loans to help poor people
7. Creates a cultural system that emphasizes the common heritage of all athenians
8. Much of this was intended to tie citizens to him personally and it helped to establish an athenian identity
9. This ties the poor to him and this means the rich can overthrow him as the poor have the numbers

Athenian Revolutions and Cleisthenes

1. Pisistratus dies in 525
2. His sons take over, and they are terrible
3. Stasis emerges again
4. Spartans take control of the polis
5. Civil war between the Alcmaeonids (led by Cleisthenes) and a faction led by Isagoras (connections to Sparta). Isagoras was named archon in 507/508
6. Cleisthenes starts talking about the lower-classes in public areas
 - a. Won their support by promising them the state
 - b. He is talking of widespread political participation
 - c. He is then exiles
7. Isagoras and the spartans take over the acropolis, which is a big insult to the athenians
8. The masses stormed the Acropolis in 507/508 in the athenian revolution and Isagoras flees
9. This is a moment of political consciousness, the lower classes acted of one mind
10. Cleisthenes returned

Cleisthenes

1. expands the rights of participation beyond aristocracy/wealthy - legitimate child of athenian parents
2. Broke up 4 tribes and created 10 new ones

- a. Each tribes consisted of three thirds (urban, rural, coastal) and were intended to represent a cross section of citizens
 - i. This allowed them to represent all the interests of the city, rich/poor, and different areas in the city
- b. Political power was divided amongst tribes which meant they had to cooperate and build consensus
- c. Aimed to create new communities that were more cross-sectional
- 3. Divides Athens into 139 deme centers, areas of local involvement
 - a. This allowed collective decisions to be made at the local level
- 4. Creates strict term limits
- 5. Creates an ostracism law
 - a. Vote on who to kick out of the city because they might be a troublemaker

Institutions of Athenian Democracy

- 1. Over the next 100 years most institutions were democratized
- 2. Assembly - legislative body open to all Athenians (men born to Athenian parents)
 - a. Ostracism law and graphe paranomon laws were used to prevent demagogues
- 3. Council of 500 (boule) set the agenda for the assembly, chosen by lot with 1 year terms
 - a. You were paid for service and fined if you missed meetings
- 4. The committee of 50 - made proposals that were turned over to the council, made up of members of the boule with one month terms
- 5. President of the committee who was taken from the 50 and held office for 1 day
- 6. 10 generals - elected by direct ballot within each tribe, could be re-elected, held accountable to the assembly
- 7. Magistrates - boards of 10 for all tasks, one year terms, no re-election, chosen by lot except positions that had specialized knowledge
- 8. Subjected to civic examination by the council and had to pledge allegiance to the polis
- 9. Elaborate court system of 6000 chosen by lot

Defining Democracy

- 1. It was not rule by the majority - this is how critics defined it referring to the dirty unwashed people
- 2. Democracy is rule by the people
- 3. Democracy is not about the number of monopoly of office but also about power/capacity
- 4. Democracy refers to the newly activated political capacity
- 5. The capacity of the whole of the citizenry
- 6. Everybody can take part in the council, and all citizens do take place in the assembly
- 7. Citizens acted as legislators themselves
- 8. Women, slaves and foreigners were not included

Isonomia and Isogoria

- 1. Isonomia refers to political equality in three senses
 - a. Equality before the law
 - b. Equal access to the law
 - c. Equal opportunity in creating laws
- 2. Isogoria refers to the equal right to speak

- a. Purpose of speaking in a democracy is for the sake of the common good or common concerns which involves a dialogue with other citizens
 - b. Citizens become conscious and active with the power to challenge and propose legislation
3. These combined concepts mean that every citizen was a law giver, and received the protections of the law
4. Democratic institutions sought to maintain and facilitate the capacity to do things
5. Law for the protection of Athens highlights the importance of democracy, vs elite rule
6. If democracy is overthrown no members of the Areopagus council are allowed to go as they are thought to be conspiring, as they are trying to reinstate the elite council
7. Emphasis on preventing tyranny at all costs

Perception of Democratic Difference

1. Democracy became an important element of Athenian identity including differentiating themselves from other political communities
2. The Persians were a monarchy, which the Greeks did not see as a good thing
3. Discussion about which type of government they should have

Otanes is in favour of monarchy

1. Monarchy gives one person power
2. Monarchy is a measure of fairness and removes the excesses of democracy

Megabyzus is in favour of oligarchy

1. Agrees with the criticism of monarchy, but thinks that democracy is rule by an undisciplined rabble
2. Should give the government to the "best men"

Darius is in favour of monarchy.

1. The problem with oligarchy is that rivalries and feuds develop. Democracy is corrupt and leads to secret associations
2. Monarchy is best because the best man rules and he would care for the people
3. Thinks that democracy is rabble
4. Everything leads to monarchy anyways, so might as well have it
5. If the monarch is free then everyone is free

Overall

1. Nobody really addresses tyranny
2. The Greeks see the Persians as very willing to give up all their freedom, and this is looked down upon

Week 3 - The Republic of Knowledge

Lecture

1. Plato is often said to be the founder of political philosophy
2. While ancient philosophy was natural philosophy, Plato turned to questions of the best life that humans could live
3. Plato presents a radical subversive and conservative approach to re-imagining politics
4. Critique of democracy
5. Radical - going to the roots and figuring out how to organize it
6. He is conservative or reactionary - opposes changes, wants things to go back to the system before, get rid of democracy

7. He thinks only the best, philosopher kings, should rule
8. The republic is an inquiry into the nature of justice
9. How do we go about finding justice, justice of the individual and of the city
 - a. Look to what justice is in the city first, then look to what justice is in the city
 - b. To do this look at the origins of the city
10. Justice is better than being unjust
11. Definition of justice - to give to each what each deserves
12. Question of why we live in a city - do this because everyone can specialize
 - a. This can allow everyone to meet their needs
 - b. Specialization allows people to get good at one thing, and this allows more free time, more production, and higher quality goods
 - c. Initially he says we would only need 4 or 5 people for this, but then he expands the city twice to achieve complete specialization and to add some relishes
13. These things only provide
 - a. Relatively basic life
 - b. No hierarchy or rules
 - c. No military class
14. While Plato is satisfied with this city Glaucon sees it as a city of pigs
 - a. Wants him to expand the city
 - b. Plato expands to give luxury goods
 - c. This requires more people
 - d. Luxurious city includes endless accumulation of wealth, war becomes important
 - i. Need more land for these people
 - ii. If you have nice stuff so people may want to take over your land
15. With the growth of the city hierarchy is introduced
 - a. They need soldiers to protect the city, more specialization is needed
 - b. Warrior class has a specific spirit and courage and will be philosophical
 - i. Compares them to dogs - they will be kind to those they know, but aggressive to those that they don't know

Justifying Rulers and Hierarchy

1. Who will rule the kallipolis
 - a. Come from the guardian class
 - b. Train people and test people to be guardians once they enter school
 - i. Make sure they don't veer from the path
 - ii. Don't want people who are going to easily change their mind
2. Auxiliaries - basically soldiers
3. Complete guardians - rule the city, protect them against external enemies, and internal threats
4. Tripartite division of the city - complete guardians, auxiliaries, merchants and craftsmen

How to Justify a Hierarchical Class Structure

1. Noble lie - philosophers love truth and hate untruth
2. Noble truths convey a necessary truth through a lie
3. Say that they are all brothers as they are all born of the earth, they are all brothers, but are not all created the same

- a. Gold, silver and iron
- 4. Each metal will generally produce children like them, but this is not necessarily the case
- 5. Nobody from the bronze class should be a guardian
- 6. Concern that nobody will believe this lie
- 7. This achieves three things
 - a. Unites the polis through giving them a common mission
 - b. Gives divine inspiration for philosopher kings
 - c. Treats the hierarchical structure of society as a meritocracy

Justice in the City

- 1. 4 fundamental virtues - wisdom, courage, temperance and justice
- 2. Wisdom
 - a. The city is wise because those who rule have wisdom
 - b. Possess prudence and knowledge about ruling
 - c. Rulers are philosophers
 - d. Shown themselves to be the best because they have gone through rigorous training
- 3. Courage
 - a. Auxiliaires have courage
 - b. Absorbed the laws of the city, and know how to preserve them
 - c. Not easily swayed
- 4. Temperance/Moderation
 - a. City is temperate or moderate because the lower part lets the higher rule
 - b. It is a form of self rule/self mastery
 - c. Lies in the city as a whole
- 5. Justice
 - a. People should stick inside their own class, don't necessarily need to stick within your profession
 - b. Injustice is meddling in things that don't belong to you
 - c. Justice is unification through specialization and mastery
 - d. The individual is part of a larger whole, need to fulfill their function
 - e. Appetites are essentially left out or subordinated
 - f. Injustice is defined as a struggle or conflict amongst parts of the whole which breaks the harmony and leads to discord

Justice in the Soul

- 1. Justice in the city is like justice in the soul
- 2. Three parts of the soul which each have a virtue
- 3. Tripartite soul
 - a. Appetite - desire or appetite for things, bodily needs of things that give pleasure
 - b. Reason - helps to suppress appetite or desires in service of a higher order being
 - c. Spirit(edness) - a will, which manifests itself in anger, to do good and to be just
- 4. Spirit wants to do good, but reason knows how to be good
- 5. Justice is the incorrect interaction/harmony between parts
- 6. Reason rules over appetite through using the period
- 7. Reason is the smallest part of the soul, appetite is the largest part

8. 5 constitutions plato discusses correspond to different parts of the soul ruling
 - a. 3 different types of appetite

The Kallipolis and Philosopher Kings

1. Purpose to figure what the just city would look like, rather than how to create the perfect city
2. Wanted to create a model of justice
3. This helps us to understand justice, so we can strive for it
4. Kings need to become philosophers, or philosophers need to become kings for this to work
5. Who is a philosopher
 - a. A lover of knowledge
 - b. Complete love of their object, they love everything about it and what to know it as a whole
6. Glaucon: wouldn't this make lovers of listening and seeing philosophers? Socrates: they see things, but not the thing-in-itself
 - a. They don't really love the thing in itself, they love things
 - b. They know things that are beautiful, they don't know beauty in itself
 - c. Objects in the world decline or decay, but the intelligible realm of thought does not disappear
 - d. Worldly objects are a representation of the universal
7. 3 categories of knowledge
 - a. What is completely *is* constitutes knowledge
 - b. What is not, constitutes ignorance
 - c. What is in between is belief - anything you know by virtue of sense perception is belief
8. Person who pursues knowledge is a philosopher, those who pursue the worldly being of sensible objects which pass away are lovers of belief

The Metaphor of the State

1. Adeimantus - most people think philosophers are cranks and completely bad
2. Metaphor of the ship
 - a. True captain is one who is trained in his crafts
 - b. He is getting older
 - c. Sailors argue with each other about who should take over as captain
 - d. None of them have learned the craft of sailing
 - e. True sailor is someone who isn't caught up in the competition, they are caught up in the craft of sailing
 - f. This metaphor describes the plight of philosophers in the city
3. Cities need to go to philosophers to convince them and ask them to rule

The Good, the Sun, and the Line

1. Most important thing - the form of the good
 - a. Masses think that is is pleasure, others think that it is knowledge
 - b. But it is higher and better than these things and facilitates the possibility of knowledge, but we cannot really know it except by analogy
2. The sun analogy

- a. The good is higher than the sun
 - b. Need the sun to see the object
- 3. The divided line
 - a. Forms - aims to explore assumptions themselves, explain things fully and conceptually rather than just applying them (reflection of spot)
 - b. Image forms - relies on specific assumptions and formulas (spot himself)
 - c. Objects - the things themselves (the form of species of canines)
 - d. Images - reflections or shadows of objects (still have a picture and apply someone else's principles to your understanding)
 - e. First principles - those who discover the principles of the world
 - f. Above that is forms of the good - it makes all below it possible

Allegory of the Cave

1. There are people chained in the cave that spend their whole lives in the cave examining shadows
2. One person gets out of the cave and sees that the projections are people outside the cave
3. The world of our sense perception is a lower world than what is thought
4. When he goes back down into the cave he gets persecuted because they are comfortable with the cave
5. This is the fate of the philosopher in the city, they care about the outside, not the shadows

Democracy as a Corrupt Political Form

1. Degenerate cities are ruled by cities that are not suited to rule
 - a. Timocracy: ruled by those whose souls are ruled by the spirited/honour-loving part
 - b. Oligarchy: ruled by those whose souls are ruled by their necessary appetites
 - c. Democracy: ruled by those whose souls are ruled by their unnecessary appetites
 - d. Tyranny: ruled by a person driven by their lowest (unconscious) appetites
2. Why do cities degenerate
 - a. The world that we live in is less real
 - b. Cities are going to degenerate over time
 - c. Sense of sense-perception is constantly changing
3. In an oligarchical polis
 - a. Democracy comes out of oligarchy
 - b. Regime driven by the people with a desire for money
 - c. In the pursuit of money some people will lose money and inequality is created
 - d. When those who become poor they cannot have a share in the polis or constitution
 - e. They are donees, hang around but have no power
 - i. Stingers - leaders of the followers
 - ii. Stingless - mindless followers
 - f. Oligarchs are caught between his father and the spendthrift character of the drones
 - i. Just wants to accumulate money

- ii. He hangs out with the drones that do whatever they want on any given day
- 4. The democratic Polis
 - a. Assigns and equality to equals and unequals alike
 - b. Disordered society
 - c. Nobody feels responsibility or duty to do anything
 - d. Not one constitution, it is many constitutions as everyone is free to do whatever they want
 - e. They rule over themselves
 - f. They are not suppressing their desires, they are giving into them
 - g. Says it is a false equality because not everyone is equal
- 5. In democracy
 - a. The principles of specialization, hierarchy and obedience have been dislodged.
 - b. There is no longer any principle of order.
 - c. This leads to a state of anarchy/disorder, in which the reasons for the polis coming into existence disappear.
 - d. This opens up politics to being a space of "belief" and allows for un-philosophical types to mislead the populous, which ultimately facilitates the emergence of a tyrant

Week 4 - Labour, Gender and Social Death

Women in Western Political Thought

1. Important to criticize theories of the past
2. Women have become people in the public realm but are still second class citizens
3. Political philosophy mostly consists of men writing about men
4. Women are often excluded from even universal theories
5. Some philosophers spent time talking about the nature of women
6. Women are often defined separately to the study of human nature
7. Often contrast women and men
8. Women cannot be simply added to the existing political theory
9. There are other forms of difference and discrimination that are ignored too

The Meaning of Freedom

1. Agreement on the value of freedom, but not what freedom is
2. It's such a vague idea that everyone can read what they want into it
3. Most of what we know of the history of the common person's view of freedom comes from writers who despised what ordinary people thought
4. Freedom was socially constructed, not discovered
5. Personal freedom - not being coerced or restrained by other in doing something desired
6. Negative freedom - absence of obstacles to your desires
7. Sovereign freedom - power to act as one pleases regardless of the wishes of others
8. Personal freedom - capacity to do as ones pleases insofar as one can
9. Civic freedom - capacity of adult members of a community to participate in its life and governance
10. Participatory politics is a necessary but not sufficient condition for civic freedom

Primitive Beginnings

1. Slaves were the ones who dreamed of freedom
2. Idea of freedom has never been divorced from slavery
3. Slaves do not belong to the social or moral community and have no independent social existence
4. State of slavery is a state of social death
5. Slaves were among the first items of trade and the slave was mostly a shared social good
6. Cherokees used the abnormal status of the slave as a way of strengthening their system of classification
7. Once free tenants were turned into slaves of the land
8. Even serfs were brothers in christ with their lords
9. Power over the the serf had come to be based largely on might and ownership of land
10. Many serfs now owned their own land the serf lost their freedom and was now owned
11. Serfdom became a stain and a badge of degradation
12. Control of the lower classes was strengthened by restrictions on their freedom of movement
13. Serfs were distinguished from slaves by their nationality
14. The free non-serf population was gaining more rights

Lecture - Labour Gender and Social Death

1. Get take home next weeks
2. Paper topics before reading week when take home is due

Thinking the Unthought or Un-Imagined

1. Patterson - freedom is defined in its relationship to slavery, slavery is a mode of social death
 - a. People are excluded from society
2. Okin - women and their relegation to the private sphere
 - a. Why have women been subordinated
 - b. Women are not seen as public beings and this is used to construct their nature
3. We want to think both backward and forward with these things
 - a. Think back to what we have already looked at (ancient Greece)
 - b. Think about these as we do more readings
 - c. Do they talk about gender, when and how

Freedom as a Political Concept

1. Slavery occupies a peculiar place in Western thought
 - a. Central in ancient Greece and primitive hunter-gatherer societies
 - b. Slaves are the people that are often taken when you go to war
 - c. After the ancient world it became hidden until modern slavery
 - d. Omnipresent in some societies, including in the form of indentured slavery
 - e. Slavery changes meaning in modern forms, from a legal relation that entailed rights to chattel slavery
 - i. In ancient times they were more than just property
2. Slavery and indentured labour were referents to theories of freedom
 - a. We think of freedom as being the opposite of slavery
 - b. As long as you were not a slave you had a higher status than someone else

- i. This gave them a bit more legal and social status
- 3. Freedom is a social contract and a contested term
 - a. For the greeks freedom is about self-determination and governing themselves
 - b. No sense of personal freedom for the ancient greeks
 - c. In modern freedom most of our freedoms are personal freedoms
- 4. Popular conceptions can pierce the intellectual conception of freedom
- 5. Freedom was an invented value
 - a. Freedom is defined by the confrontation between slaveholders and slaves
 - b. Slaves are trying to assert their freedom, while slave owners are trying to assert their power
 - c. Also confrontation between slave owners and other free persons
- 6. Patterson argues that freedom has 3 different types, but they are mixed and overlapped in different ways
 - a. Personal freedom - capacity to do as one pleases insofar as one can, not being interfered with by others
 - b. Sovereign freedom - power to act as one pleases regardless of the wishes of others, this includes taking more than one's share, a sociological concept like a chain
 - c. Civic freedom - capacity of adult member of a community to participate in its life and governance
 - d. In real societies there is different emphasis on these types, as well as tension and conflict between these definitions

Slavery as Social Death

- 1. Slavery - permanent, violent, and personal domination of natally alienated and generally dishonoured persons
 - a. Personal domination of one person over the other, including power over life and death
 - b. Exclusion or ex-communication of the slave from the community, slaves are outsiders
 - c. Alienation of the slave from their culture, homeland, kin, taken from their place, and they are excluded from the culture
 - d. Honour of the master is determined by the dishonour of the slave - the more slaves you have the more honour you have
- 2. How did society come to accept this relationship
 - a. Patterson is talking about primitive and ancient slavery, where slaves were not taken for economic purposes, but for socio-cultural and existential purposes
 - b. Slaves were the constitutive outside, take slaves to show who they are not, members define their freedom against slaves social death
 - c. This is sovereign freedom, freedom over the slaves
- 3. Slavery distributes social dishonour and solidifies internal dynamics of the community
 - a. Constantly at war with other tribes
 - b. Slave is a person within the society that you hate which brings the community together
- 4. Slaves are kept alive, when they should have died in the war

5. They were treated as junior kinsmen, they were sometimes treated quite well

Social Death in Ancient Greece

1. Citizens did not include slaves
2. People who were socially dead did not have freedom and could not participate in governance
3. Women could also be seen as socially dead as they do not have the right of social or political participation, do not have civic freedom
 - a. Men have sovereignty freedom over them
4. The republic
 - a. The bronze class (skilled craftsmen) are deprived of political rights
 - b. There were also forms of manual labour and slavery
5. Plato thought that women could become philosopher kings - also some think that this was a joke

From Slavery to Serfdom

1. After 375 CE serfdom begins to emerge
2. Serfdom emerges out of
 - a. Slaves were freed but still dependent as they were dependent on the need to land to survive
 - b. Free farmers were pushed into serfdom, their social status has fallen, happens through accumulation of debt, or they are enslaved, some voluntarily enter for serfdom, or they were forced into it
3. This serf-lord relationship was reciprocal through reflected dependence of the serf
4. They were not truly free, but they had a sense of their own freedom
5. Legal and ideological differences allowed serfs to view themselves as different than slaves
6. In christianity they saw themselves as being brothers in christ with their lord
7. While serfs were not naturally alienated but this meant greater personal domination over them and serfdom become hereditary
8. Serfs were tied to the lord
9. People defined themselves as free in relation to/against serfdom
10. Emergence of an feudal hierarchy structured by sovereignial freedom
11. Shift in serfdom between 1300-1500
 - a. Decline in population increase in available land
 - b. Economic status was getting better for serfs
 - c. Upper Classes consolidate their power, construction of a monarchic state
 - d. Serfs were now tied to the land and subject to increased taxes and greater forms of exploitation
 - e. The serfs were still subject to social death
 - f. Important for thinking about thomas more

Gender

Gender and Political Theory

1. We need to look at the way certain theorists may talk about women and how these modes of thought continue to affect people's lives in major ways
2. Women as second-class citizens today

3. Difference between formal and substantive equality
 - a. Formal - equal under laws
 - b. Substantive equality - the treatment in the social sphere, are they actually able to use their freedom
4. Okin: which "assumptions and conclusions" support or produce the idea that men and women are "fundamentally unequal"? Can these assumptions and conclusions help us understand the continuing inequality faced by women?

The Universality of the Male Position

1. Western political theory consists of writings by men, about men, and for men
 - a. Man and humans are purported as universal/inclusive terms
 - b. Or is man a term that excludes women
 - c. Falls back on a de-facto male norm

The Politics of the Family

1. Argues that leftist thinkers have often avoided some of the problems with gender and political theory
 - a. They have questioned the family as an institution
 - b. They do not idealize nature
 - c. Neither of these things are a given
2. In assuming and naturalizing the family others reproduce women's subjugation
 - a. Women are defined by their functions within the household and conceptions of virtue
 - b. Men are defined outside of their family roles
 - c. Women's then subordinate role is said to be their nature
 - d. This is circular reasoning
3. Theories define men's nature opposed to nurture while women's nature is defined by their nurture
 - a. Look at innate nature outside of the household and society
 - b. Whereas women's nature is looked at as they exist in society
 - c. Ask what are men like, what is their potential, where is women are often asked what are women for
4. We cannot just add women to political theory
 - a. Need to rethink the tradition and avoid placing women in patriarchal roles
 - b. With a shift in focus the entire play looks different
 - c. Think about this in terms of the course as a whole

Week 5 - Utopia, Dialogue and Shipwreck - Book 1

Thomas More

1. 1478-1535
2. Killed by Henry 8th because he wouldn't sign off on his divorce
3. Invented the word Utopia
4. Book was written in 1515 and modeled on Plato's republic
5. Critique of existing political order and presentation of an alternative political order
6. Gives a critique of England

7. Offers and alternative - question is is the utopia something that we can and should realize

Utopian

1. Place of perfection, imaginary and indefinitely remote place, and an impractical scheme for social improvement
2. Topia - place
3. U -
 - a. Eu - good
 - b. Ou - non-place or no place
4. Plays with the paradox between the no place and the good place
5. Means no place in terms of the place that does not currently exist, not that it can't ever
6. Means both good and no place

Problems of Interpretation

1. Does more want it to be confusing
2. Is utopia the place we need to realize or it it the place we need to avoid
3. People who see it as a good place see it as a blueprint for society
4. Also can be read as a place that cannot be realized, but is a place we should strive for
5. Also read as more is trying to show us how terrible a commonwealth would be
 - a. Slavery
 - b. Private property
 - c. For-hire soldiers
6. Question of if he is a Catholic, medieval and conservative or humanist, modern and radical
 - a. Looking for a recuperation of christianity
 - b. May involve a return to monastic living
 - c. Those who argue it is a humanist - looking to ancient greece to learn how to recuperate human agency
 - d. Emphasize friendship, moral reading of the bible
7. Should the text be read literally or allegorically
 - a. Second half of the book has been taken by catholics and socialists
 - b. Allegorical - read between the lines as it is littered with jokes and puns, don't take it all seriously
8. Is the book political or apolitical
 - a. Is it trying to create change, or is it talking about how people should re-orient against the public life
9. These binary interpretations ignore the nuance in the book
10. In being a dialogue it kind of mirrors plato's books
 - a. This is a real dialogue as they have actual conversations
 - b. At the end there is no real conclusion to the conversation
 - c. You are supposed to take the dialogue and think about it
11. A dialogue about dialogue
 - a. Talks about the way in which they discuss politics in England

Structure of Utopia

1. Can read it as one of the people being the protagonist

2. Is 'more' the character, or is More the writer
3. Rapheal = archangel, healer, heavenly physician
4. Hythlodai or Hythlodais - Hysthols = nonsense, daios = destroyer of nonsense
5. Thomas = the doubting apostle
6. Morus = Moron
7. Neither character can be taken as the writer himself
8. Text is a dialogue
 - a. Exchange between two differing characters
 - b. Book 1 - dialogue about dialogue and political space
 - c. Book 2 - monologue, but one that ends with an ambiguous or incomplete dialogue
9. Dual dialogue
 - a. Internal to the text - more's own political thought and his psyche
 - b. External to the text - dialogue is the path to utopia rather than being a blueprint

What's in an Occupation

1. About a diplomatic trip that More took to brussels
2. Goes to Antwerp to see peter giles - his real life friend
3. Raphael - he has knowledge about unknown people and unexplored lands
 - a. He is an adventurer and his sailing is like plato and ulysses
4. Raphael is not a real ship captain he can draw and read a map and take us where he wants to go
5. He has no grasp of utopia's location, he presents only the image (experience) of Utopia
6. Raphael - learned in latin, studies greek philosophy, does not like roman philosophy
7. Raphael has recently returned from the new world
 - a. Learned about other ways of living
8. Going to the new world was a big shift for utopians
 - a. Get ideas from places and civilizations that were discovered
9. What is the image of utopia
 - a. He can describe the civilization but it doesn't mean that we are getting a perfect description, and it doesn't mean that we can reproduce it
 - b. Exists in the same time that more is writing, it is just in a different space
 - c. Rapheal is not a ship captain he can't get us there but he can portray an image
10. What might this say about utopia
 - a. Difference between the accents and modern - do we need to realize an ideal
 - b. Plato would need to tell lies to maintain utopia
 - c. Need forces to prevent change and dissemination
 - d. If we did reach utopia we would be stuck there
 - e. Critical utopias - utopia is not about the blueprint, it is supposed to teach you to think and desire more within a given society
 - f. No point in constructing it if you can't get there

The Cita Activia and the Problem of Court Life

1. More wrote book 2 first
2. For Giles raphael's experience and knowledge should lead him to enter public life
3. Rapheals response takes up almost all of book 1

4. Being in service to a king is like being
5. Kings were warmongers at this time
6. Kings can learn stuff from other people and they would be better people if they did
7. Raphael refuses the praise and suggests going into service for a king would do no good
 - a. Anytime you throw out new ideas people see it as an insult to themselves and throw it out
 - b. Argue that should do it this way because that is the way that it has been done
 - i. Historical fallacy
8. He has two reason for refusing the suggestion
 - a. Nature of politics in its present incarnation - they seek war and wealth
 - b. Nature of court life - kings pursue these things but courtlife reflects this as well

Hythloday at Cardinal Morton's Court: The Social Critique of Contemporary England

1. Recounts a story of his experience with Cardinal Morton
2. What happened
 - a. Lawyer is talking about capital punishment of theives
 - b. Raphael - it is unnecessarily harsh, ineffective deterrent, ignores root causes of theft
 - c. Criticises class inequalities in England - noblemen living off labour of others, vagabonds without work, problem of creating standing armies
 - d. The poor have a choice between starvation and theft
 - e. People bouncing from jobs become unhealthy and cannot work anymore
 - f. The sheep "[commonly so meek and eating so little]; now, as I hear, they have become so greedy and fierce that they devour human beings themselves."
 - i. Lords have kicked serfs of the land because they want to use the land for the sheep to graze
 - ii. Beginning of the enclosure movement
 - iii. Price of wool is going up
 - iv. Deprives people of their ability to survive
 - g. Development of oligopoly
 - h. Poverty and luxury exist side-by-side
 - i. Vices (gambling, prostitution) push more people into poverty
3. His solution
 - a. Limit the roots of these ills
 - b. Limit oligopoly
 - c. Restore agricultural production
 - d. Goal is for england to be a better commonwealth
4. Lawyers response is that raphael is ignorant and a forignder
 - a. Same reaction to what would happen in court
5. Cardinal Morton intervenes - wouldn't mitigation increase theft, how would raphael solve the problem

- a. Violation of divine law because of harsh approach
 - b. If execution is punishment for theft, then might as well murder all witnesses
 - c. His proposition - pay back what they own, and do forced labour
- 6. Lawyers says that this would put England in peril
- 7. Morton - perhaps this could be introduced by kings slowly
- 8. Now everyone is on board
- 9. Point - anytime he challenges norms it goes badly, not about saying genuine ideas more about getting the support of the king

Content, Narrative and Meta-Narrative

- 1. Provides us with a critique of modern society
- 2. He tells the story to show the futility of taking part in political life
- 3. Raphael is recounting a conversation, and having one
- 4. Court life - competition, ridicule, closed thinking; sycophancy; space of domination (public opinion), no openness or freedom, largely one person talking or many people talking with a single voice
- 5. The garden with Giles and More - literally and metaphorically open; realm of dialogue; structured by friendship (respect despite disagreement and difference); open to experimentation

Philosopher Kings

- 1. More - tells him again that Raphael should engage in politics
- 2. Raphael says that
 - a. Kings may become philosophical, but philosophers will get nowhere in court life
 - b. Kings have been brought up badly and have false values
 - c. If he is driven by virtues then nobody is going to listen to him
- 3. More's response - two philosophies
 - a. Raphael's direct approach - say what you think
 - b. Indirect approach - act and suck it up like all the other advisors
 - c. More wants him to stick with it and use the indirect philosophy in a way that is less extreme
 - d. Cannot change everything, incremental minor reforms are better
- 4. Raphael's response takes up the rest of the book
 - a. This is opportunistic and misses that the existing institutions cannot be reformed
 - b. He has a preference for truth over false speech
 - c. England no longer follows Christian principles
 - d. He has been to utopia, where they have solved England's problems through communal property
 - e. Idea of good men is problematic
 - f. Private property gives a false sense of justice
 - g. Private property is the root of England's problems
 - h. Utopian institutions have eliminated these problems through allocation of goods and private property
- 5. More's objections to the abolition of private property
 - a. If people stop working people won't live well
 - b. There will be a lack of authority and respect for magistrates

- c. Without private property nobody will know what is theirs so there will be civil strife
- 6. Raphael to "thomas"
 - a. Not surprised he thinks this way
 - b. Doubting thomas
 - c. Wants to recount what happened so he can see and assess it himself
- 7. Giles
 - a. Our ways are older/better
 - b. More and Giles are shipwrecked on an island of repressive public opinion
- 8. Tells them
 - a. Utopia is older than england
 - b. Culture has been developing for a long time
 - c. Utopians didn't know about them
 - d. Romans were shipwrecked there and were listened to
 - e. In the space of the garden more and giles want to hear more about utopia

Week 6 - Utopia, Dialogue and Shipwreck II

Lecture

- 1. Raphael goes through the details of Utopia
- 2. Utopia is an island
 - a. Geographically protected
 - b. Man-made island
 - c. It's hard to get to and can only get to it with a utopian pilot
 - d. It is broken off from the unjust ways of the world
 - e. We can't get there again, but we can hear about it and mimic it
- 3. Utopia is in the new world
 - a. Utopias brought the civilians to a high level of culture that they now surpass almost every other people
 - b. Suggests that the indigenous people can be civilized, Europeans can be even better
 - c. Question of if they are greek descendants, or if they are indigenous people
 - d. The idea of a civilizing mission
- 4. 54 cities
 - a. All uniform in size, customs, laws, appearances
 - b. Mirror the greek polis - has a city section and a rural section
 - c. Agricultural production is done by a rotating system of labour
 - d. Mutual education - education is taught by individuals who specialize in their field
 - e. Produce more than subsistence - food is distributed throughout the island
 - f. Each city sends reps to the capital for political discussions

Political Structure

- 1. Representative (republican) system
 - a. One phylarch per 30 families
 - b. One tranibor/head phylarch over 10 phylarch
 - c. Four senators
 - d. One governor

- e. Issues of public good can only be discussed at assemblies on pain of execution (to prevent corruption)
 - f. One day wait before discussing proposed policies
- 2. No nobility class, reps rule in the interests of all

Work and Occupations

- 1. Everyone is taught farming and one craft
 - a. People often follow the crafts of their parents, but they don't have to
 - b. If they want to switch then they will go live with someone else who has that craft
 - c. People can take on more crafts if they want to - but this depends on the needs of the island
 - i. Different from Plato's principles of specialization where you only do one thing forever
 - d. Utopia does have slaves, but they are not a slave society
 - e. Avoid idleness, everyone should be working
- 2. They have a 6hr workday and then they can choose to do whatever they want, as long as it is productive
 - a. They have more efficient production and moderate wants
 - b. Only some are exempt and they choose to work as they want to lead by example
 - c. Everyone works
 - i. Inducing beggars, nobility and women which More doesn't see as currently working
 - d. They are not producing luxury items
- 3. Goal: "withdraw as much time as possible from the service of the body and devote themselves to the freedom and culture of the mind. For in that, they think, lies the happiness of life."
- 4. This book is written around the time of the transition to capitalism
- 5. Utopia is older than Europe - it took longer to develop likely
- 6. Raphael is critiquing More's comment about how communal property doesn't work
- 7. Contemporary anthropological of indigenous societies demonstrate how there can be different ways of structuring the economy
 - a. They produced only for their own use
 - b. They didn't use tools to produce more goods, they used them to have more free time
 - c. Work isn't seen to be a good, it is seen to be a necessity

Social Relations

- 1. Organized among patriarchal familial likes
- 2. Head of the household is the oldest man, women go to live with husband's family
- 3. Non-nuclear families
- 4. Households between 10-16 adults
- 5. Keep cities to a certain population size
- 6. When there are too many people in a household they will re-distribute them
- 7. When island is saturated they colonize surrounding areas (entitled to wasted land)

Economic Features

1. Each city is divided into 4, each zone has a market, head of household takes what they need from the market
2. No money economy, gift and abundance
3. Women work, but they are given the lighter jobs to do
4. People in cities eat communally
 - a. In the Phylarchus home
 - b. They don't have to but it is a social custom
5. People in rural areas tend to eat at home
6. Women prepare the food, slaves clean
7. Separate room for nurses and children
8. Children over 5 work by waiting on tables
9. The oldest are given the best food then they serve everyone else
10. Disdain the slaughter of animals
11. Alternate old-young
 - a. Keep a system of surveillance and teach them
12. They have readings on moral issues and music

Travel and trade

1. Require permission to travel the island - avoid idleness, slavery if they violate it twice
2. Slavery is not hereditary
3. See people that leave as trying to avoid work
4. They produce a surplus, 1/7th is given to other countries, rest is sold at a fair price
 - a. Often don't collect the money
 - b. Often collect it if they need the money for war
5. Emphasis on the rejection of pride and greed in favour of compassion
 - a. Invert the relation to precious metals
 - b. People come to define themselves by wealth and showing off

Happiness and Pleasure

1. Philosophical people, interested in ethics and morals
2. Interested in questions of happiness which is tied to pleasure
3. Pleasure for them is tied to
 - a. Immortality of the soul - soul drives us towards these things
 - b. Reward in the afterlife for good deeds
 - c. Punishment in the afterlife for sin
4. Shouldn't harm others, pleasures shouldn't be followed by pain
5. Celebrate people to accept their death readily
6. Pleasures are connected to virtues which lead to happiness
7. Doing good things, doing our share, helping other gives us joy in life
8. Honour and worship divine majesty
9. Reason instructs us: 1) to honour/worship divine majesty; 2) to live a joyous life, free of anxieties, and to help our neighbours
 - a. More individualistic in Europe
10. Critique of false pleasures - things that heighten oneself, and lower others, pursuing wealth and opulence and seeking status
11. Three criteria of true pleasure

- a. Does not harm others
 - b. Does not preclude greater pleasure
 - c. Is not followed by pain
 - 12. Killing animals reduces compassions
 - 13. Two types of pleasure
 - a. Intellectual
 - b. Bodily
 - c. Bodily pleasures are lower than intellectual pleasures
 - d. Too many bodily pleasures can undermine your health
 - 14. Greeks thought we were enslaved to our bodily pleasures
 - 15. Plato - philosophers know the true pleasures because they have experienced them all - utopian subvert this
 - 16. Raphael is not defending utopia, he is only describing them
- Slavery, Euthenasia, Marriage
1. Slavery
 - a. Classical conception of slavery
 - b. Taken in war and for punishment
 - c. Not hereditary or racialized
 - d. Not just about punishment, honours for people who do good, they can work their ways out of slavery
 2. Eutheanasia
 - a. Encourage the sick elderly to commit suicide if they are unable to complete duties
 - b. They have outlived their life
 - c. Encouraged and celebrated, not forced
 - d. Concept of retirement doesn't exist
 - e. Expectation is that they continue working
 3. Marriage
 - a. Men 22, women 18
 - b. Pre-marital sex is frowned upon
 - c. Engage in premarital sex can never get married, and the family is looked down upon
 - d. Shown to each other naked before they marry so that there is no deception
 - e. Marriage lasts for life unless there is adultery or mistreatment
 - f. Important and sacred thing in utopia
 - g. Violations of marriage bond are punished severely
 4. There are not a lot of laws in utopia
 - a. Don't want lawyers to be needed to interpret the laws
 - b. Institutions breed people to be good
 - c. Citizens can know the laws
 5. Don't make treaties with other nations
 - a. Treaties suppose that naturally, you are at war with people
 - b. Nobody follows treaties anyways
 - c. For utopians we are all bound by friendship

Military Practices

1. Avoid war where possible
2. Justifications for war
 - a. Protect their land
 - b. Defend their friends and allies
 - c. Freeing oppressed people
3. This is a critique of european practices
4. Don't celebrate bloodshed, they try to win wars through being cunning, aim is to prevent deaths
5. The Zapoletes
 - a. Hire them as mercenaries
 - b. Both sides will often hire them
 - c. Don't look on them very kindly
6. If they send their own people they are by choice, keep families together so they fight harder

Religion of the Utopians

1. System of religious toleration and diversity of religions
2. Most believe in a single deity
3. Most wisest worship a deity that is "unknown, eternal, infinite, inexplicable, beyond the grasp of the human mind, and diffused throughout the universe, not physically, but in influence."
4. Raphael introduced them to chirstianity
5. They see it as a positive belief system and a lot of them convert
6. Religious harmony, no disorder or strife
7. Utopia' creation of utopia
 - a. Previously divided by religious conflicts
 - b. Religious reforms allowed an openness of practice under rules of respect for others
8. One requirement
 - a. Must believe in the eternity of the soul, without this there is no incentive to fear for their deeds in life
 - b. Can discuss with priests, but not common people
 - c. There are no images in the church so that everyone can worship whatever image they want
 - d. Everyone can think of Mythra as their good
 - e. Church services are non-denominational

Utopia vs other commonwealths

1. In other commonwealths individuals wealth is lauded
 - a. Individual interests are put above common ones
2. In utopia everything is common
 - a. Rich is re-defined - "to live joyfully and peacefully, free from all anxieties, and without worries about making a living."
 - b. Fairness of a form of equality that leads to a rich life
3. Contemporary society is devoid of equity and justice
 - a. Most are reduced to the status of an ania

- b. Creates laws against them
 - c. Commonwealths in contemporary Europe is a conspiracy of the rich, and their riches are never enough
- 4. Raphael - if not for pride all people would adopt utopian life
 - a. Pride measures what other people lack
 - b. Pride is anchored in human nature but it can be overcome by utopian institutions

More's Response

- 1. Begins with a rejection - many of their ways are absurd
- 2. Communal property alone subordinates nobility, splendor, and majesty which are the true ornaments and glory of any commonwealth
- 3. More has changed his critique
 - a. End of book 1 - logistical problems of common property
 - b. End of book 2 - he falls back into the popular view
 - c. Raphael criticized this view as everyone is afraid of new ideas
 - d. Is More's acknowledgement of his common-sense argument a sign that his character is shipwrecked, as if this showing that Raphael is a dogmatic philosopher who has closed off the possibility of critiquing what he says
- 4. Dialogue ends so that the reader can think about it
- 5. Parting claims
 - a. "in the Utopian commonwealth there are very many features that in our own societies I would wish rather than expect to see."

Week 7 - Colonialism and the Dystopia of the New World

Lecture

Discovery of the New World

- 1. The new world was opened up to the European imagination
 - a. Figurative - Thomas More, John Smith
 - b. Literal - new lands, resources etc
- 2. European colonialism is a dystopian nightmare
 - a. Undercuts their livelihoods
 - b. Genocide
 - c. Slavery
 - d. Undermines their traditional ways of life
- 3. Marx - larger economic context as the way in which people survive is being changed
 - a. Argue that these changes are central to the development of capitalism
 - b. Accumulation of goods and wealth in the new world feels the industrial revolution
- 4. Casas - gives a ground-level view
 - a. Frame it as a civilizing and conversion mission

Primitive Accumulation

- 1. Marx uses this term
- 2. Primitive capitalist accumulation
- 3. Using force to accumulate wealth
- 4. In feudalism there is no market - no private ownership either
- 5. To get private land people have to be kicked off as they have to seek out wage labour to survive

6. By privatizing the land there is a trade in land and a trade in labour
7. This is a critique of Adam Smith - humans have an innate nature to trade
 - a. Markets have always existed but they have been fettered
8. Primitive accumulation - using state power to dispossess people and take over the land
9. It is the original storing of capital
10. Under feudalism we don't have capital - nobody has the ability to produce more and more, in order to have development you must have stored capital
11. The enclosures movement helps to produce two markets that did not exist before but are necessary to capitalism
12. For Marx primitive accumulation didn't just take place, rather colonialism was the key to primitive accumulation
 - a. Dispossessing people from land and transforming the mechanisms of life
 - b. This wealth fueled the industrial revolution
 - c. They exploited colonies in order to create wealth and capital
 - d. Transformation of local political and economic structures and their incorporation into the circuits of capital
 - e. Corrupt the systems into producing for European wants
 - f. Ideologically justified under the guise of civilising mission

De Las Casas

1. Born 1484 or 1474 died in 1566
2. Initially a colonist, but had a spiritual awakening
3. He thinks civilian mission should be done in a better way

Appeal to the King

1. He justifies kingships by divine ordination
 - a. Caveat - they are shepherds
 - b. If the commonwealth suffers the only reason can be that the ruler is unaware of it
 - c. The Spanish monarchy was given rights over the new world so that its people could be properly ruled and converted

New World and its people

1. His description of them falls into the trope as a noble savage
2. Describes them as simple, submissive, obedient, innocent
3. Says that they would be ideal Christians
4. Not against the civilizing mission, just about how it is being carried out
5. Spanish fell on these gentle lambs like ravenous wolves
6. Estimates that 12 million people were directly killed - we don't know where he got this number
7. Las Casas is concerned by the behaviour of the Christians but not colonization itself

The decimation of Indigenous Ways of Life

1. Real goal of colonizers was the extraction of resources which led to the destruction of traditional modes of life
2. Forced taxes on them
3. Local communities were forced into a mixture of feudal and capitalist relations
4. They enslaved them, used them as slaves and concubines
5. Failure to supply for Spanish needs resulted in removal of local leaders

6. Indigenous people are reduced to European needs
7. Force them to produce what they wanted
8. Local population were treated as beasts of burden - like donkeys and cattle

Christianity in the new world

1. Las Casas - driven by greed, Christianity is corrupted in the new world
 - a. Story of the cuban ruler and the god of the spanish
 - b. Christianity is corrupted by the drive for gold and private property
 - c. Las Casas was compelled to write by friends out of concern for the direction of the Christian faith
 - d. Still supports the mission, but it must be carried out by Christian needs
2. Fixing this lies with the king
 - a. The shepherd must look after his flocks
 - b. Revoke charter and make sure that people are acting in good ways
 - c. Guilt the king into doing something, not blaming him
3. These crimes are against god and threaten to bring a collapse of civilization and to presage the end of the world
 - a. Apocalypse is going to come, we need to act now

Week 8 - Popular Sovereignty and the Republic of Property

Lecture

Locke Liberalism and Good Governance

1. 1632-1704
2. Father of political liberalism
3. Challenge to ancient political theory - challenges the idea of starting with the polis, and starts with the individual instead
4. Reasons why they leave the state of nature determines what the role of the state is
5. classical liberalism doesn't call necessary for public participation - if government leaves us alone we don't need to be involved
6. Right of revolution - if government is not good we have the right to overthrow it
7. A lot of what he is saying is indirectly directed at hobbes
 - a. Hobbes talks about the social contract
 - b. Hobbes believes in absolute monarchy as humans are self interested, and the state of nature is bad
 - c. He is writing during the english civil war, during anarchy and chaos
 - d. Need to have one person with absolute power to keep everyone in check
8. Locke thinks that an absolute monarch is very problematic - doesn't want government to invade people's property
9. Government's job is to protect your right to property
10. Locke really just wants a constitutional monarchy, but wants the king to rule through the consent of the people
 - a. At the time the divine rights of kings
11. People have just and natural rights - sovereign must respect these rights and not trample on them
12. Locke - government and political power are earthly things

- a. Come into the state of nature experiment to determine where political power comes from
- 13. Political power - right to make laws with the penalty of death, and all lesser penalties in defence of the commonwealth for the public good
- 14. Private property is a right
- 15. Employing the force of the community - it is our power, even if we give it to someone else, and we can overthrow it

The first state of nature

- 1. He is a social contract theories
- 2. Society is a contract, we join it voluntarily
- 3. Resolutive compositive method - idea of taking an object apart and putting it together to see how it works
 - a. Break society down into the individual
 - b. What is the individual like
 - c. What drives human nature outside of society
 - d. What do a group of humans do
 - e. Why do people leave the state of nature
 - f. How does the state solve the problems of the state of nature
- 4. For Locke the state of nature is
 - a. A state of perfect freedom - there is no authority over you
 - b. State of equality - we are all equally free
 - c. Not a state of license - it is not a state where you can kill or dominate others, we are not to infringe on anyone's life, liberty and possessions
 - d. We wouldn't harm other people because we are all gods property and don't have the right to destroy god's property
 - e. There are laws of nature
 - f. We have reason because God gave us reason
 - g. There is justice - everyone punishes those who offend them, everyone is the executioner of the law of nature
 - i. Rectifitory justice
 - ii. If anyone takes your property you have the right to seek reparations, or even kill them
 - iii. You can get other people involved in enacting justice with you
- 5. In this version of the state life is tranquil
 - a. There is effectively a form of society even with no government or laws
 - b. There are still laws of nature
 - c. All people are members of this, and we enter into political society through our own consent and choice

Locke's property theory

- 1. God has given the earth to mankind in common
 - a. God did not give it to kings, they don't have a right to the property they have
 - b. If everything is shared, then there is never a right to take property
 - c. Things become your property through labour theory of value - by picking the apple it becomes yours

- i. When you mix your labour with things, it becomes your property
 - ii. This gives the thing more value, and you intermix part of yourself into it
- 2. Given abundance is there unlimited accumulation
 - a. Laws of nature still limit you
 - b. There is a limit to how much work you can do, can only claim as much property as you can work on - labour limitation
 - c. Need to leave enough good things for other people - enough and as good limitation
 - d. If you take something to let it spoil you violate the right of communal property, use property wisely - spoilage limitation
- 3. At this point we have yeoman farmers - small often family farmers
- 4. Locke assumes that there is an abundance
- 5. Property is a natural right but nobody takes more than their share
- 6. According to Locke private property is more productive, and by enclosing it you need less of it
 - a. If we cultivate land it becomes more productive
- 7. At this point there is no real conflict over property

Money and Inequality

- 1. Previously we had a system of yeoman farmers - small farmers that work only for themselves, and produce their own subsistence
- 2. Things change with the introduction of money
- 3. Through money people have figured out to hoard money and produce more excess as money doesn't spoil
- 4. As you get more money you can buy more land and produce more
- 5. Eventually you get to a point where there is no spare land
- 6. For those that don't have property or land
 - a. Go to a place where there is land
 - b. They can rely on charity from the people that have lots of land and money
 - c. They could also do wage labour - people cannot work directly for large plots of land, can trade your labour through your voluntary consent
- 7. There will be a complete properterization in the world - with inequality more people will invade each others land

The Other state of nature

- 1. Why would we leave the state of nature if everything works - because there are problems there
- 2. There is a problem of administering justice - laws, self interest, lack of power
- 3. There is also inequality and the problem of security property
- 4. Two creatures lead to a state of war
- 5. State of nature and a state of war are different
- 6. In administering justice people are forced into war
- 7. When someone threatens your natural rights we are put into a state of war with them
- 8. State of nature is an ill condition
 - a. Not well run
- 9. Why do we enter society

- a. To establish a neutral arbiter of justice
- b. To protect their lives, liberties and estates, or in other words their property
- c. Suggests that we enter into society freely and determine what the laws are together, impartial implementer of the laws

The social contract and the entrance into political society

1. Political society can only come about by the consent of everyone to leave the state of nature
2. People give up the rights and privileges of administering the law to the community
3. Two fold contract
 - a. Everyone must first agree to enter political society
 - b. After this, the majority determines what form of government will be established
 - i. This establishes legislative power
4. Power is transferred to the government as a fiduciary trust, the people retain sovereignty
5. Problem - we are born into societies and the contract is not real
 - a. We give our tacit/implicit consent by staying in society and using its services
 - b. He tells people that if they want to not be in society that they could leave, but he doesn't think that people will leave if the government is good, government is already minimal
6. Legislative branch is supreme and limited
 - a. Supreme - power of establishing and determining laws
 - b. Limited by the purpose it was founded for
 - c. The legislative cannot transfer its powers to someone else
 - d. It is still tied by the laws of nature
 - e. Laws have to be promulgated - made public
 - f. Fiduciary trust - people retain sovereignty and can revoke government through a "conservative" revolution
 - i. Conservative - conserve the system, just overthrow the government
7. Transformation of meaning of politics
 - a. Ancients - politics as a way of life
 - b. Locke - politics and government is purely instrumental
8. Locke's separation of powers
 - a. Legislative - makes laws that are intended to preserve the community, not necessary to always be active
 - b. Executive - enforces laws that the legislative makes
 - c. Federative - deals with foreign relations
9. Executive and federative need to be in action at the same time, so they can be the same people
10. Don't want the same people enforcing laws that create them as well, this avoids corruption
11. Locke wants a constitutional monarchy
12. The king will be the executive and federative branches

The liberal shift in politics

1. Key aspects of classical liberalism
 - a. Centrally concerned with the individual

- b. Society is nothing more than a collection of individual wills
- c. Politics is instrumental (it is just a means to an end)
- d. Politics is a limited sphere
- e. Freedom is primarily defined as negative liberty

Week 9 - A Republic Against Property

Lecture

1. Marx is a critic of the liberal imagination
2. Manifesto is similar to a political platform
3. Marx offers a critique, not a blueprint
4. He is responding to events that are occurring in Europe at the time
5. Marx wrote it in 1848 and there were workers revolutions occurring at the time that were being put down by liberals and conservatives
6. Marx wants to spread the word of communism so that people can link up their revolutions
7. Marx points out that history changes over time, and capitalism hasn't always been here, so it can be changed and moved

The Manifesto as Critical Utopian Text

1. Marx critiques a number of schools of socialist and communist thought
 - a. Reactionary socialism - socialism that wants to turn back the clock and go back to feudalism
 - i. Marx's critique says that this system ignores the domination that existed in feudalism
 - ii. It is also anachronistic - we can't go back in time and remake human life
 - b. Conservative/Bourgeois socialism - idea that we can make capitalism better, have capitalism without class struggle
 - i. Capitalism depends on the proletariat and class struggle
 - c. Critical Utopian Socialism -
 - i. They are onto something, get the gist of what is wrong with capitalism
 - ii. But it is abstract garbage
 - iii. They have blueprints
 - iv. Think they can overthrow capitalism by starting a commune
 - v. Not imbedded in history, wants to sit outside of history
 - vi. Utopian substitutionism
2. None of these schools are in step with history
3. If we really want to think about capitalism we need to look at the immanent reality within history
 - a. Immanent - internal to history
 - b. Need to look at historical movement and agents of change within history
4. More's book is very ambiguous - and it becomes a model for blueprint texts
 - a. Utopian texts after More take up the blueprint model
 - b. This gives utopia its pejorative meaning - impossible and undesirable
5. The manifesto does not provide a blueprint
 - a. It says little about future society other than basic parameters
 - b. It describes historical development and the proletariat

6. Manifesto is a critical-utopian text that aims to
 - a. Provoke and inspire hope for a better future
 - i. Exposing the horrors of capitalism
 - b. Precipitate the emergence and subjectivity of the actors that can herald a better future
 - i. Shows us that we are not stuck with this system
 - ii. Trying to inspire people to act to transform it
7. Marx has been accused of historical determinism
 - a. History is determined in advance, we don't have to act
 - b. But this is not what Marx is saying at all - tell the proletariat to act
8. A class in-itself - the proletariat is the structure of capitalism, a class for itself - they need to become aware of their own structure and role
 - a. Once they become conscious of its role they transform from being itself, to for-itself
 - b. He wants to explain the proletariat to the proletariat

Class Struggle as the Motor of History

1. Goal of manifesto
 - a. Explain the emergence of capitalism within feudalism
 - b. Explain the historical role of the bourgeoisie
 - c. Explain the historical role of the proletariat
 - d. Explain the nature/meaning of communism
2. Every society has divisions of classes, and he thinks that dominant classes are always trying to suppress and the subservient classes are always trying to overthrow

The Bourgeoisie Reuse of Dominance

1. Class struggle is dialectical
 - a. When the subservient overthrow the dominant class they produce new forms of oppression
 - b. Dialect of emancipation - the false universality of liberalizing classes, the ladder of class relations
2. Bourgeois is oppressed under feudalism
 - a. It was fettered (restricted by feudalism)
 - b. A series of developmental change this - technological development, colonialism, and growth of markets
 - c. Feudalism remains a blockage to development. But this leads to the political development of the bourgeoisie.
 - d. When you have a closed system of land ownership you don't have private property, but you had merchant capitalism but they were fettered by feudalism - taxed to death when you traded
 - i. There wasn't general commodity exchange
 - e. Colonialism helps the bourgeoisie as there are new markets and increased primitive accumulation
 - i. There is a growth in markets in general
 - ii. This increases the power of the merchants, and bourgeois
 - iii. The bourgeois is still fettered

- iv. Once they develop enough they can burst and overthrow feudalism
- 3. Economic and political development of the bourgeois begins in the womb of feudalism
 - a. At a certain point, the feudal relations of property/production are no longer compatible with the productive forces that have begun to grow within its womb.
 - b. Result: the system bursts in the revolutionary re-constitution of society by the bourgeoisie as a rising class.
- 4. With the overthrow of feudal relations the bourgeoisie creates a world after its own image
 - a. A new socio-economic regime in universal interests
 - b. The executive of the modern state is but a committee for managing the common affairs of the whole bourgeoisie - the government works in favour of the bourgeois so they make laws to support private property
 - i. This overthrows the aristocratic state
 - ii. The state protects bourgeois interests, but also protects them from their own greed

Capitalism's Progressive Character

- 1. Marx is not just a critic of capitalism
 - a. In scarcely a 100 years capitalism has produced more than in the rest of history
 - b. Before we had a basic agricultural production, now we have a technological transfer of the world
 - c. Marx says that nobody produces anything on their own - they build off of existing technologies, and they have workers, build off of other people's work
 - d. Capitalism is built off of a contradiction - private accumulation off of communally produced wealth
- 2. Cosmopolitan character of capitalism
 - a. A mix of people coming from different areas
 - b. Capitalism is not isolationist - it is global and globalizing as it tried to expand
 - c. Says that capitalism batters down all Chinese walls - referring to the opium trade
- 3. Capitalism compels all civilizations to introduce bourgeois
 - a. Breaking down all borders to create a global governance
 - b. It reproduces its own structures in other places
- 4. Capitalism - progressive in that it is producing more stuff and that it is transforming other economies
- 5. Transformers the systems within Europe as well - it has done away with the ties that bind people to each other, and has replaced it with self-interested transactions
 - a. Social relations become permeated by cash and exchange relations
 - b. The result is the disenchantment of the world - rearrange from what God has given us, to something that is the most rational and useful
 - i. We are no longer believers or suspicious
 - ii. This lays bare the foundations of capitalism
 - c. We no longer believe in God's supremacy, instead believe in capitalism
- 6. Capitalism is dynamic - it wants rapid change
- 7. Bourgeois is like a sorcery that it is no longer able to control its powers - capitalism has a mind of its own

8. It is crisis prone - markets are unstable, there are periods of recession and growth, people get paid low wages and are unable to buy things
- 9.

Proletariat as an object of capitalism

1. A thing that capitalism makes and transformed
2. It comes out of the serfs and skilled laborers from feudalism
3. Dual freedom - they are freed from feudal relations, but they also no longer have access to land and are forced to sell their land
4. The labourers have to sell their work and become a commodity, by doing this they increase capitalist power
5. Capitalism changes the workers
6. Deskilling - they no longer master a skill and instead to small bits in a factory
7. Military style organization of production - organize in a regimented controlled way (Taylorism)
8. This allows them to pay them less because everyone can do it
9. Everyone gets pushed down into the working class
10. Pay them the base minimum, and they then put their wages back into the capitalist system to survive

Proletariat as a Revolutionary Subject

1. Through being objectified the proletariat can become a subject - a class for itself
2. Class struggle starts with the birth of these classes but proletarian struggle remains underdeveloped - like the luddites attacking the machines instead of the system itself
3. The factory system facilitates the conditions for the development of consciousness: individual - factory - union/trade - class
4. In feudal times rural people would have been isolated
 - a. Capitalism is an inherently urban system of production
 - b. Put a bunch of people in a factory and they see what everyone is subject to
 - c. Individual workers will resist their bosses - but things like individual resistance can turn into class resistance
 - i. This is just peoples factory not a class - turns into a union or trade consciousness
5. Union/trade consciousness - people realize that the conditions are similar between companies and factories and then they put themselves in the same category and struggle
6. Marx wants all the working class to come together and realize that their treatment is bad everywhere
7. The bourgeoisie depends on the proletariat to overthrow feudalism as the bourgeoisie is not the majority of the population

From False to Real Universality

1. Constant exploitation
2. The state has to control the bourgeoisie to keep the proletariat alive
3. Dictatorship of the proletariat - when the bourgeoisie is no longer fit to rule the proletariat should step in and take power
4. He argues that the conditions for communism exist within the capitalist system itself

- a. People are not going to accept their enslavement forever

Communists and their Goals

1. The name of communism has a power but it is being used as a scare tactic
2. International working men's association - the emancipation of the working classes must be concerned by the working class themselves with a motivation for equal rights, duties and the abolition of all class rule
3. Goals of the communists
4. Abolish private property
 - a. Marx says they want to abolish bourgeoisie
 - b. Want to do away with the property that has a social power and gives you power over other people
 - c. Workers should have a right to remuneration for your work
 - d. Not a means of destroying the means of production - turn it into a form of collective ownership
5. Abolition of Freedom and individuality\
 - a. Marx says they want to abolish bourgeois freedom and individuality
 - b. Freedom is being able to use and sell their labour as they see fit
 - c. 9/10 of the population has to sell themselves to have a living
6. Abolition of the family
 - a. Marx - the bourgeois has already done this by reducing to a money relation
 - b. They have reduced the family to a cash nexus - the wife and kids survive off of the husband's income - question of if they love each other, or if they just need each other to survive
 - c. The wife is almost like a wage worker for the household, and she produces children part of their work
 - d. Proletarian family - instituted universal prostitution - a family has to sell themselves to capitalists in order to survive

Abolition of Capitalism as a Social Trophy

1. The bourgeois confuses bourgeois production, culture and society with general production, culture and society
2. Capitalism is a relatively new phenomenon - it is historically specific
3. Another society is possible, and the proletariat must win democracy

Week 10 - Gender and a World Without Patriarchy I

Lecture

Challenging the Absence of Gender

1. Gilman takes women from the background and puts them in the foreground
2. Herland asks what is women's potential - more than what women do (in line with what Okin wants)
3. Challenges patriarchal norms
4. See what women can do outside of a patriarchal relationship
5. What exactly is Gilman doing with this - what is her purpose
6. Is she trying to build a gendered utopia, or is she just saying that we should think about women in our society in a different way
7. The men are confronting the structures of their own society

8. He claims that it is a civilized nation, and are aryan but this is in comparison to the locals who are "savages"
 - a. It is likely based in south america
9. Example of difference feminism - argues that women have different traits than men
 - a. Women are compassionate, caring, mothering
 - b. It reduces women just to being mothers

Alienation as an Antidote for Shipwreck

1. Bertolt Brecht
 - a. Alienate things that are seen as normal
 - b. De-naturalizing and re-reifying experience and social structures
2. Alienation effect - think about your real life as a historical event
3. Just because it is historical doesn't mean that it is natural

Alienation, Dialogue and the Male Gaze

1. Gillment uses something like the alienation effect
2. Aims to show women's potential and challenge patriarchy
3. They make us question our own norms
4. Protagonist represent three male gazes
 - a. Terry O. Nicholson - the machismo archetype
 - i. Rich dude
 - ii. A jerk
 - iii. Thinks of women as sport
 - iv. Chad
 - b. Jeff Margrave - the chivalrous archetype
 - i. A doctor
 - ii. Knows all about nature
 - iii. Old chivalrous type who puts women on a pedestal
 - iv. Wants to worship women
 - c. Both Terry and Jeff see women as objects, want to go back into preconceived notions of what women are
 - d. Vandyck Jennies - balanced or reasonable archetype
 - i. He is a sociologist
 - ii. He is more willing to learn and explore
 - iii. He wants to consider the society and its reality
 - e. They all have similar ideas regarding the outside
 - i. They think that there has to be men in there
 - ii. By the end Terry has not changed
 - iii. Jeff thinks that it is a better society than male dominated societies
 - iv. Vandyck - he is going to see women as equals, he is going to bring his wife back with him

Utopia, Image and Civilization

1. Van says that everything he says he is recounting from memory
2. He says he is not going to tell us where it is
 - a. Doesn't want men to try to conquer it or rule it
 - b. Fear that men will see it like colonization

3. Is this like Rapheal - he is telling the story from memory, question if it is a blueprint, can we trust the narrator
4. First attempt to get to herland
5. Temporally concurrent - just in an unknown area, it is happening at the same time as our own
6. The locals (savages) tell them about this society that nobody has ever come back to
7. They try to get the guide to take them there, they find a piece of cloth that no other society in the region had made
8. This utopia is differentiated from the savages that live around it
9. He says that the women are of aryan stock, although it is likely based in south america
10. They want to go to herland, but they don't have time to climb the cliff
11. They decide to come back on their own, with terry's money

Expectations and Entering Herland

1. The men share their expectations
 - a. Terry - swingers club
 - b. Jeff - nature spa
 - c. Van - more measured, not so sure, thinks there will be a brother society nearby, believes that the women will want to protect themselves as they wouldn't want visitors
 - d. Terry - women will be jealous, believe that women will fight amongst each other, because of this he can become their king as he is rational
 - e. Jeff - nuns, they will be chaste
 - f. Van - not religious, thinks women will be normalist
 - g. They project their own society, and their own perspectives of women, onto Herland
2. Try to find the river
 - a. They describe the river like a woman's body, and they feel entitled to do what they want with it
 - b. They name the river feminisa - naming what they are is telling them what they are supposed to do

First Encounters in Herland

1. Fly over and say that it looks like every country
2. Along their walk they encounter three girls
 - a. Beautiful, dressed in civilized attire, speak a musical fluent speech
 - b. Assume the girls are late teens
 - c. The women are very agile and quick, so the men can't catch them
 - d. They don't understand their language
 - e. Terry decides to get one to come close so he can grab them
 - i. This plan fails
 - f. They have a sense of that they can do what they want to these women
 - g. Men have an adversarial relationship with them, see them as people that they are able to capture
3. Venture further into the territory
4. They see that it is a cultivated place, with road, fruit, things you can eat

- a. A people skilled caring for their country
 - b. Cultivated to be useful and used
- 5. Encounter a group of women
 - a. These women are on stage as they haven't been married off into social death
 - b. These women are not young and charming
 - c. The women start guiding them to an unknown place - the women are trying to guide them into a building
 - d. The men start to fight - they didn't think the women would fight them into the first place, the women are stronger than them and there are more of them
 - e. Confront the assumption that women are weak and are private citizens

Awakening to a New World

- 1. The men awaken having been put to bed
 - a. Provided with comfortable clothes
 - i. Surprising as women in their society dress for the male gaze
 - ii. Herland clothes are easy to move in and comfortable
 - b. How will they be treated
 - i. Terry - deliverers - deliver them from their exile from men
 - ii. Jeff - guests
 - iii. Van - curiosities - they are different, sociological interest in the men
- 2. They debate escape
 - a. There is a door in the room, and it opens on to a dining room
 - b. It is filled with 18 women, the older kernels
 - c. The women are cordial to them, not prison guards
 - d. They are fed
- 3. They aren't being formally restrained, but they are being guided
- 4. They are each given a tutor
- 5. They are each given a kids book so they can learn the local language - the women want the men to write out their equivalent words so that the women can learn about their culture
- 6. Think utopia - the women want to be rescued from shipwreck - they are cut off from other societies, but they do want to move beyond it
- 7. Terry remains shipwrecked as he doesn't change his ideas
- 8. Women are intuitive and motherly in terms of meeting their needs
- 9. Men debate if there are men in Herland
 - a. Terry - believes that Jeff is an idiot
 - b. Jeff - not sure
 - c. Van - thinks that there is a male society nearby
- 10. General idea (other than for Jeff) believe that men are required for civilization
- 11. Jeff's observation
 - a. No signs of men and the women don't seem to notice that they are men
 - b. Treat them as if their being men is an accident
 - c. There are no gender roles in this society
 - d. In patriarchal society one is treated in accordance with gender
 - e. The men expected to be treated in a certain way because of their genders

- f. Men are supposed to be rational, women are emotional
- g. Men are subjects, actors in the world where women are subjects
- h. Outside of binaries, women lose their sense of self/identity

Life in Herland

1. They have freedom, but are always being surveilled
2. Their language is scientific, it is an old civilization
3. Jeff finds everything interesting, and Terry hates everything
4. Terry is shipwrecked, he is stuck in his gender binary stuck ways
5. Terry want there to be men so that he can show how masculine he is, and there to be men to conquer
6. Terry has an androcentric view (men centred) and his identity is caught up in gender binaries
7. Women are also shipwrecked because they can't get out, difference is the women are willing to learn
8. Terry is really unhappy here

Escape and Return

1. Terry wants to escape
2. The other men don't really care, but they don't let him go alone
3. When they get to the plane it is covered in cloth
4. They encounter the three girls
5. They start playing a game with the girls, women are good at the game, whereas them men are terrible
6. After playing the game with them for a bit they try to convince them to get their knives to cut the cloth
7. They chase the women, but as they are going back to the plane the kernels meet them again
8. The kernels take them back, they are not punished, but the men feel that they have done something bad
9. They are taken back to the building in a motorized vehicle
10. As the drive back they notice that there are women, girls, and girl children
11. The three tudors give them explanation of what is going on
 - a. They want to learn from the men, they want the men to learn their language
 - b. Learn that women watched them the whole way of their escape
 - c. Women knew that the men were going to escape
 - d. The men were not captives, they kept them in the first place because they had tried to commit violence against women
12. The men continue to learn about herland
 - a. They continue to learn the language they are given books
 - b. They learn that there have been no men for 2000 years, but they have reproduced through parthenogenesis (virgin birth)
 - c. Women point out the double standard regarding virginity
 - d. Women have a dialogic rather than a monologic outlook
13. Discussion of cats and dogs
 - a. In herland cats are useful and are friends - there are only some male

- b. The cats don't make sounds, and they don't kill birds
- c. Terry responds that it is hard on thomas - it is hard on the male cat
- d. In hisland dogs are largely male and man's best friend - women ask if they are also women's best friend, dogs are more friends with the boy children than the girl children
 - i. Cats are let free to roam
 - ii. Dogs are locked up
 - iii. Point out the issues in men's society

Origins of Herland

1. Emerged from a series of historical misfortunes
2. They once had a king and both men and women
3. Wars
 - a. They moved up the coastline, leading to men being killed
 - b. They built up protections
 - c. They are a slave holding and polgamous society
 - d. There was an earthquake and a volcano - puts them in a place where they cant get out
4. There is a slave revolt that kills all the men, old women and children
5. The women outnumber the slaves so they revolt and kill all the slave men
6. The surviving women learn trades from the slave women
7. Become a community because they need to work together cooperatively
8. They are surviving but are not reproducing
9. One woman becomes pregnant, and they can't find men - she gives birth to 5 girl children
 - a. The whole society dotes on these children
 - b. The 5 children give birth to another 5 girl children
 - c. Society is reproducing through parthenogenesis
10. Shows us that outside of patriarchy women are different
 - a. They have had to develop traits they wouldn't have had
 - b. Did Not develop feminine traits that men would have expected them to develop
 - c. Gilman - patriarchy denies women an active role (subject vs object)
 - d. Women in this sense are subjects of the world, not objects
 - e. Their nature is to mother and nurture others
 - f. Raise children so that they can act on their own
 - g. They develop a maternal pantheism - religion of mother nature where mother nature is the center of the universe that nurtures metaphorically and literally
 - h. Women progress through cooperation and caring
 - i. The women don't have war-like gods - all about nurturing characteristics
11. Gilman was writing in 1915
 - a. Suffrage movement
 - b. Men had to leave to go fight
 - c. Women had to take a more active role in the workforce
 - d. Women had more autonomy in the household with the men gone
12. Terry - women can't organize, they are jealous and presumably fight

- a. He is falling back on binary thinking
- b. Jeff points out that they don't have anything to be jealous of, they are collective to survive
- c. Terry complains that there is no sport or competition, he argues that this makes them not womanly
- d. Terry says that motherhood doesn't mean anything if there is no hope of fatherhood
- e. Problem for Terry is he has no outlet to show his manliness

13. Cooperation vs Competition

- a. The men say that competition is the motor power
- b. Women say that motherhood is not a competition
- c. Terry - women don't work but are loved, idolized, honoured and kept in the household to care for their children - except poor women
- d. There is a private/public divide - women exist in private, men exist in the private family, and in the public
- e. Poor women have to work, even though they have lots of kids
- f. Rich women don't have to work, and have fewer kids

More Details about Herland

1. Van's observation
 - a. Limited knowledge of some things, know a little bit about other societies
 - b. Have no knowledge of others history
 - c. Have a basic knowledge of some sciences
 - d. Observes that the women are smarter
 - e. Women know more about their society than in their society
 - f. Women have a good system of education, and they teach everyone
 - g. Men begin to lecture, and everywhere they go the women know about them and their ideas
2. Terry - why keep the men locked up
 - a. Everyone is a mother, so if they hurt a woman, then the mothers would probably kill them
 - b. The men may be a threat to the women
 - c. They have an idea of motherhood
 - d. Contrast this to the idea of brotherhood - this is a system of competition
 - e. Women show that they are capable of cooperation
3. Further development of herland
 - a. Division of labour, but have a problem of an eventual shortage of land
 - b. Number of births outstrip how much they can produce
 - c. They get rid of all their cattle, grazing land is not efficient
 - d. They plant cultivated fruits and vegetables
 - e. Women get together and decide to not have as many children - they repressed the motherhood nature
 - f. They are not denying the women motherhood, as they can look after the children collectively
 - g. They are conscious makers of people - motherhood is more than giving birth

h. They have some aspect of eugenics

Seminar

-
-
-
- 1. Still offers a critique of society
- 2. Nurture - people are raised and are privileged for being men,

Nov 25th Gender and a World Without Patriarchy II:

Binaries and Patriarchy

- Terry: Herlanders are more feminine insofar as they lack facial hair; lack femininity otherwise.
 - Van: this is rooted in Terry's idea of the private nature of motherhood.
 - Gender binaries involve two things: 1) relationality of terms; 2) the hierarchy and opposition of terms, including dependence vs. independence.
- Men given increased freedom including tours with tutors.
 - Van and Jeff get along with theirs.
 - Terry does not get along with his. Why?
- Why don't the women use last names?
 - Women know their family histories; children have own names.
 - Sign other things. But, with children, "the finished product is not a private one."
- Van reflects on the lack of self-reflection in his society.
 - Hubris in response to other societies (Terry on Herland).
 - Herland has a "reasonableness."
 - Dialogue (with desire to improve) vs. monologue.
 - Lack of self-reflection was why the men avoided topics about their society.

The Women and their Society

- What were the women like?
 - Similar but still different (but not excessively so).
 - Different personalities (education and mutation).
 - Van on their intelligence: "they were born to it, reared in it, that it was as natural and universal with them as the gentleness of doves or the alleged wisdom of serpents."
- Forward thinking society.
 - Population limits and re-making of plant life.
- The women were intuitive and shocking.
 - Intuitive: figured out the faults of the men's world.
 - Shocked the men because they were different than the "feminine vanity" of their women: "frills and furbelows," "submissive monotony," "pettiness," "jealousy," and "hysteria."

Striving for the Unattainable

- Part of the men's shock lay in wanting to find faults.
- Somel: "our standard of perfection seems to get farther and farther away."
- What does this say about Herland as a utopia?
- Possible fault: eugenics insofar as "criminality" is bred out.

- Somel: would a parent drill their own child's teeth or let a specialist do it? Van: false equivalence. Somel: Education is a high art/craft for the women. They only entrust children to the "most highly competent."

The Men's Relationships with Women

- The men are allowed to lecture to general audiences.
 - Intercultural exchange. Women assume that in the men's world they've "helped one another all over the globe, sharing your discoveries, pooling your progress. How wonderful, how supremely beautiful your civilization must be!"
 - The men's interest is in the young girls in the audience.
 - Terry only attracted a "combative group: keen, logical, inquiring minds, not overly sensitive, the very kind he liked least."
 - Jeff attracted the artistic types.
 - Van is the most popular here.
 - Terry is infuriated by Van's popularity
- The men started a courtship with the three girls.
 - Jeff worships Celis; Terry has a combative relationship with Alima; Van develops a deep friendship with Ellador.
- The women's response to the men's arrival.
 - The council: "From another country. Probably men. Evidently highly civilized. Doubtless possessed of much valuable knowledge. May be dangerous. Catch them if possible; tame and train them if necessary. This may be a chance to re-establish a bi-sexual state for our people."
- Van's popularity.
 - Somel: "you seem more like us." And: "in a bi-sexual race the distinctive features of each sex must be intensified. But surely there are characteristics enough which belong to People, aren't there? That's what I mean about you being more like us – more like People. We feel at ease with you." Why not Terry or Jeff?

The Courtship with the Girls

- The different dynamics of relationships.
- Each relationship is shaped by the men's temperament/outlook.
- Courtship in bisexual society vs. Herland.
- Jeff's failed attempts at "chivalry."
- The problems of Terry's masculinity: "These women have never been mastered."
- No family unit or "home" in the men's terms. Van: "They loved their country because it was their nursery, playground, and workshop – theirs and their children's."

Love, Family and Struggle

- The lack of sex-love in Herland.
- Oriented towards motherhood and sisterhood. Saw men as potential partners in parenthood.
- No idea of homelife. Terry: "A man wants a home of his own, with his wife and a family in it."
- The men find Herland boring.

- Terry: “They’ve neither the vices of men, nor the virtues of women – they’re neuters!” A “perpetual Sunday school.” Terry: “life is struggle” and devoid of this, “there is no life.”
- Social Darwinism vs. mutual aid.
- Van: from the time of birth the women “knew Peace, Beauty, Order, Safety, Love, Wisdom, Justice, Patience, and Plenty.”
- Children treated as “people” too.
- Van: two different life cycles in patriarchal society
 - For the man, “growth, struggle, conquest, the establishment of his family,” and whatever gain’s or success he can achieve in life; for the woman, growth and securing a husband, then subordination to family life and “‘social’ or charitable interests as her position allows.”
 - Herland: growth and development were structured by motherhood as the ultimate goal.
- Child rearing in Herland.
 - 1-2 years: mother. After: the educational system. Happy and peaceful environment, not struggle.
 - Somel: goal is to stimulate/feed the mind. Games intended to spur judgment and will.
 - Van: “This was education for citizenship.” The children in his world are bored and tied to the “onerous duties of the older people.”

Religion in Herland

- Ellador on religion.
 - The men’s religions are rooted in Fatherhood and Brotherhood.
 - Lots of bad ideas: sacrifice, the devil and damnation.
 - Women had bad ideas but changed. Van: losing tradition. Ellador: progress.
- Women’s religion structured by motherhood.
 - “Their Great Mother spirit was to them what their own motherhood was – only magnified beyond human limits.”
 - Mother: supportive, caring and nurturing. Not personified: spirit.
 - No idea of doing things for this higher power, only doing them from it. Improvement.
- Different religions = different political structures.
 - Men’s world: god = rulers. Women’s: common motherhood.
 - The mother god doesn’t want anything from the women. But the patriarchal tradition demands reverence and preservation.
 - “Revealed religion” of the men’s world is conservative. Commandments.
 - “Applied religion” of the women’s is progressive. The Mother “desired their welfare and especially their development.” Van: “they lived as if God was real and at work within them.”
 - Women’s temples occupied by the most motherly.
 - Van: they are “more Christian than any people I ever saw.”
 - No eternal life/afterlife. Work for “Peace and Beauty and Comfort and Love – With God” in this world.

Marriage

- The men are going to marry the girls.

- Jeff: men should give the women their names.
- Terry and Jeff on meaning of marriage.
- Women: love involves loving someone for being them.
- Marriage anthem: “the New Hope for their people – the New Tie with other lands – Brotherhood, as well as Sisterhood, and, with evident awe, Fatherhood.”
- Adding Fatherhood/Brotherhood to Motherhood.
- Terry: “We’ll teach ‘em!”
- Problems: raised in different worlds. Despite knowing this, the men assumed “we could convince them otherwise.” Again, monologue vs. dialogue.

Homelife, Sex and Love

- Given their differences, homelife is a problem.
 - Herland only values men as fathers (masculine mother).
 - No home or conjugal life.
 - Men want to be “alone” with wives. The women always think in we’s.
- Same problem emerges with sex.
 - For the men, sex leads to higher feelings; for the women, sex is for procreation. Van and Ellador’s discussion.
 - Van: in their world, men seek the comfort of women to escape the male world. In Herland, no ultra-masculinity or ultrafemininity.

Exile

- While the others “grew together in friendship and happiness,” the same cannot be said for Terry and Alima.
 - Alima the most feminine but also the least able “practical psychologist.”
 - Terry: “There never was a woman yet that did not enjoy being mastered.”
 - Ultimately, Terry attempts to sexually assault Alima.
 - Terry’s trial. Van: wouldn’t have happened in their country.
 - Terry: the women “were incapable of understanding a man’s needs, a man’s desires, a man’s point of view.”
- Terry is sentenced to exile.
 - Terry: “They don’t know the first thing about Sex.” Van: “When Terry said Sex, sex with a very large S, he meant the male sex, naturally; its special values, its profound conviction of being ‘the life force,’ its cheerful ignoring of the true life process, and its interpretation of the other sex solely from its own point of view.”
 - Patriarchy, power to name, women as “sex.” Van vs. Terry.
- The exile plan: Van and Ellador will go too.
 - Jeff: Van will have to tell her about “our noise and dirt, our vice and crime, our disease and degeneracy.”
 - Celis gets pregnant. “The New Motherhood.”
 - Van to Ellador: he’d rather have her “than all the children in the world.”
 - Ellador meets with the council. Not prepared for link to men’s world. Ellador will report back.

What is the Politics of Herland/Herland?

- What is the political meaning/significance of Herland? What is the function or purpose of this feminist utopia?
- The men's different relationships suggest possibilities.
- Return to Mother/the womb – rebirth vs. shipwreck.
- Terry's relationship to Alima as the model of (or metaphor for) shipwrecked patriarchy and the politics of colonization.
- Jeff's relationship to Celis/Herland as a mirror image: shipwrecked on Herland.
- Van's relationship to Ellador as the possibility of a "fusion of horizons." Rebirth.
- Herland as image and mirage (for the shipwrecked) that mirrors Herland's understanding of perfection and progress.

Discussion Questions

- 1) How does Herland challenge ideas about politics and gender that we encountered in other readings or that we encounter in the real world of politics? (question re-upped from last week)
- 2) Is Herland a blueprint for a feminist utopia? Why or why not? If it's something else, why and what? Explain your answer drawing on the text.
- 3) Van is seemingly presented as the reasonable one of the men. Should we take this at face value? Or might there be reasons to question or doubt his account of Herland?
- 4) Assess Herland (the book) and Herland (the society). What problems do you potentially see with them?

Week 12 - The Poetics and Politics of Anti-Colonialism

Challenging Colonialism

1. He changes who the main character is, and it changes the story
2. The tempest - about prospero and the other europeans who come to take his island
3. Caliban and ariel play background characters - in a tempest they are the main ones
 - a. Purpose is to challenge eurocentric ideas
4. Aime Cesaire (b. 1913, d. 2008) was a writer, poet, politician and a founder of the negritude movement.
 - a. Place emphasis on their black identity
 - b. Is criticism

Cesaire's Critique of Colonialism

1. He challenges the connection between colonization and civilization
2. Colonialism is not about bringing ideas to colonies, it is about exploitation
3. Had to find justifications for enslavement, because it isn't christian, but they explain it through them being pagans
4. He says that cultural exchange is good and without exchange they atrophy, but colonialism isn't exchange, it is an attempt to force european culture on others
 - a. Europeans see them as barely above animals
5. He says that colonization dehumanized the europeans
6. Colonizers see the others as an animal, and treats them like and animal, and their civilization becomes barbarism themselves
7. Why use shakespeare

- a. Flip the play
- b. Shifts the location to the mediterranean to the caribbean
- c. He rewrites it for a different audience - a black colonized audience
 - i. Embrace their diasporic identities, and stop trying to assimilate
 - ii. They are not the animals, the europeans are

Plurality, Identity and Contingency

- 1. The tempest is singular, a tempest is one among many
- 2. European civilization sees itself as universal
- 3. He is saying that there are multiple cultures
- 4. Characters are the same, though Ariel and Caliban are tweaked and Eshu is introduced
- 5. Prospero - former duke
- 6. Miranda is his daughter
- 7. Ariel is mixed race
- 8. Alonzo - king of naples
- 9. The characters are all the same, eshu is introduced - black devil guy
- 10. Caliban is a black slave, ariel is a mixed race slave
- 11. The prologue
 - a. They are not their characters yet
 - b. Told to help themselves to different masks of the characters
 - c. Mask demonstrate the lottery at birth
 - d. Race is a social construct

Shipwrecked by a Tempest

- 1. The play begins with a tempest and a shipwreck
 - a. Europeans are on a ship and the storm is rattling it
 - b. Gonzolo talks about how everything is different, unexplored and magic lands
 - c. The europeans are rational, the other is magic
 - d. This makes them different than the europeans
 - e. The europeans trick them into hating their culture
 - f. They are shipwrecked metaphorically, before they are shipwrecked literally
 - i. They are stuck in their european mindsets
- 2. Prospero and miranda are looking on
 - a. Miranda is concerned for the people
 - b. Prospero is not because he had the storm created
- 3. Prospero has to leave because of political disagreements, he was ousted
 - a. He went to these lands to colonize them
 - b. He is reported to the inquisition and he is supposed to go on trial
 - c. Before he goes on trial he is marooned on the island
 - d. He was given books and tools
 - i. Things that he needed to civilize the indigenous people
 - e. Enemies have decided to take the island from him as well
 - f. Being a magician, he knows they are coming and shipwrecks them

Master and Slave

- 1. Ariel entered to tell him that he has carried out the plan, he has sunk the ship
- 2. Ariel is disgusted with himself - prospero has forced him to do his bidding

3. Prospero doesn't like the criticism, and chastises him for being an intellectual
4. Ariel begs to not do this work again, prospero has promised him his freedom thousands of time
 - a. Prospero dangles the freedom, power is in prospero's hands
 - b. Has the power of death over ariel
 - c. Ariel does something because he wants his freedom, but he also doesn't want to be punished
 - d. Ariel is passive
5. Enter caliban
 - a. Caliban is becoming too emancipated, starting to step out of his position
 - b. He says Uhuru when he enters - this means freedom in arabic and swahili
 - c. Caliban speaks french, and his native dialects
 - d. He is not the uncultured savage that cannot speak well as it in shakespeare's play
 - e. He seems to be more linguistically able than prospero
 - f. Prospero calls him "dumb animal, a beast I educated, trained, dragged up from the bestiality that still clings to you"
 - g. Caliban: Prospero only taught him a European language so he could understand orders; has own language; wasn't given real education.
 - i. Colonizer wants to pretend he is civilizing him, but the real motivation was to exploit them and make them do work
 - ii. Caliban has his own language, had a culture before the europeans got there
 - h. Caliban says that he would be king without prospero being there
6. Discussion around Sycorax.
 - a. Prospero says that caliban;s mother was a ghoull and not worthy of being the child of
 - b. Natal alienation - he is alienated from his kinship roots and culture
 - c. Caliban sees nature as a part of him
 - d. Culture also lives within them, it is about being passed on
 - e. Caliban taught prospero, he wouldn't have survived without him
 - f. Prospero then cast him out, and sent him to a dirty cave
 - g. Prospero says that he case caliban out because he tried to rape his daughter
 - i. He says that prospero put those thoughts in his head
7. Prospero tells him to leave and get back to work or be whipped
8. Caliban's name change
 - a. Prospero gave him the name, and forced on him
 - b. European colonization - power to name and define
 - c. Says his name is an expression of hatred
 - d. Caliban may come from the word cannibal
 - e. In renaming himself he wants to embrace his roots and embrace diasporic identity
 - f. New name he wants to use is X

- i. In math it is the unknown value - he doesn't know his true identity because he has been divorced from it
 - ii. Recouping his identity in some sense
 - iii. Challenge incorporation and assimilation into european culture
- g. He leave and uses uhuru again
- 9. Ariel enters
 - a. Prospero tells ariel that caliban is the enemy
 - b. Before prospero was hellbent on revenge against the europeans
 - c. He then tells ariel that he doesn't want the europeans to be harmed, all they have to do is protect, ariel is going to watch over them
 - d. Repentance is a christian ideology
 - e. The europeans are men of his race, he has a connection with them
 - f. The europeans will back him against the black slaves
 - g. He wants to create closer connections with the europeans - have his daughter marry ferdinand
 - h. Discussed as a sea nymph ariel starts singing and draws ferdinand to miranda, and they start flirting
 - i. Prospero enters and chastises his daughter, tells ferdinand that he needs another slave
 - j. Prospero puts a spell on him, and ferdinand follows hom

Two Roads to Emancipation

- 1. Caliban is working and ariel enters
 - a. Ariel: brothers "in suffering and slavery, but brothers in hope as well."
 - b. Hope to achieve their emancipation in different ways
 - c. Caliban sees Ariel as an Uncle Tom/house slave
 - d. Ariel: he's there to warn Caliban, who can't beat Prospero. Prospero has promised Ariel freedom
 - i. Ariel sees convinced that this freedom is going to happen
 - ii. Ariel thinks that the master has good within hom
 - iii. Caliban thinks freedom is going to come with violence, whereas ariel thinks that they can appeal to the masters goodwill
- 2. Debate about violence
 - a. They are both rational beings capable of speaking
 - b. Shared sense of oppression and demand for freedom
 - c. Ariel opposes violence, and turn the other cheek, suck up enough prospero will change his conscience and release them, thinks prospero is a moral being
 - i. Matter of freeing prospero from his colonial conscious
 - d. Caliban sees this as cowardice that ignores who prospero is, says they must fight for emancipation

Colonial Exploitation

- 1. Gonzalo, Sebastian, Antonio and Alonso draw out the exploitative nature of colonialism
 - a. They have been married on the island
 - b. They theorize that if exploited the island would be richer than egypt

- c. Problems that solve themselves - indigeneous people, and the need for workers on the island
- d. They must take every precaution to not import our shortcomings, keep the indigenous inhabitants as good and noble savages
 - i. Don't need to civilize them, just need to exploit them, take them as they are

Aristocratic Conflict

- 1. Prospero and ariel play tricks on them
 - a. They put food in front of them, and take it away
 - b. They decide that they are not going to eat
 - c. Prospero wants ariel to force them to eat
 - d. Ariel says that it is evil to play with their hunger
 - e. Prospero says that this is how power is measured, I am power
- 2. Antonio and sebastian hatch a plot
 - a. Decide to kill them
 - b. Ariel stops the plot from happening, tells them that prospero sent him there
 - c. Didn't realize that they were on prospero's island
 - d. He says that prospero is willing to forgive them if they repent

Rebellious Alliances

- 1. Ferdinand and Caliban working in the fields
 - a. Ferdinand sings a song about working all day
 - b. Caliban is resentful
 - c. Caliban sings a song about machia, the leader of the haitian revolution
 - d. Enter miranda, enter prospero who takes ferdinand away and imposes a double shift on caliban
- 2. Caliban works and hears voices
 - a. Enter trinculo and stephano who don't notice each other
 - i. Their individual responses to caliban - they discuss caliban
 - ii. Trinculo suggest that they take him and put him in fairs
 - iii. Stephano says that he is going to take him and show him at carnivals
 - iv. Show subhuman nature of them
 - v. Discuss civilizing him, but wonder if he is even able to speak
 - vi. They also try to feed him booze, but caliban refuses it
 - b. Discussion of the shipwreck. Stephano: it killed a bunch of "old farts that were always keeping the world down." "Down with tyrants!" They assert their republicanism
 - c. They are jokers, comedic side show
 - d. Debate over who will be king. Caliban: "Long live the king!" He spurs them to rebellion against Prospero but they still look at him as inferior
 - e. They are both working class people - cesare is challenging marxism - points out that the working class has racist ideology too

Prospero's Order Besmirched

- 1. Prospero tells Ariel to get the gods ready for the wedding

- a. Prospero: "starting today I want to inculcate in them the spectacle of tomorrow's world: logic, beauty, harmony, the foundations for which I have laid down by my own willpower."
- b. Constructs a binary better civilization and savages
- c. Idea that prospero is the bringer of light and the enlightenment
- d. Problem is that miranda notices eshu - a uraba god - a nigerian god
 - i. Besmirches the order that prospero is trying to create
 - ii. Eshu says that he is a devil to his enemies, and a god to his friends
 - iii. Prospero says that he wasn't invited
 - iv. Throws off mission of logic, beauty and harmony
 - v. Symbolizes diasporic nature of the people in the caribbean
 - 1. Brought there by someone else
 - 2. Things imposed on him
- e. Makes prospero question his own powers and tells ariel to take care of caliban's guerilla force
- f. Prospero is concerned that his magic powers are weakening, especially as caliban is resisting

Failed Alliances

- 1. Caliban et. al. confront Prospero's power
 - a. Idea of colonization includes dominating nature
 - b. Prospero dominates nature as well, and tries to transform it
 - c. Binary between nature and culture - caliban sees him being one with nature, prospero sees it as being separate
 - d. Calian - prosperio is anti-nature, uses it for his own purposes
 - e. Caliban breaks into a war song - when Shango strikes, money, lies, and larceny expire
- 2. Caliban realizes his mistake with his alliance with trinculo and stephano
 - a. His allies go for the shiny trinkets prospero left along the way
 - i. Flips the script - trinkets were left there for the natives, but the europeans were the ones distracted by them
 - b. They were more interested in trinkets than they were in overthrowing a despot
 - c. Prospero - "Strike your master, your benefactor! Don't tell me you're going to spare him!" Caliban: "Defend yourself! I'm not a murderer."

A Happy Ending?

- 1. Everyone is unharmed, everyone, including prospero will return to europe
- 2. Ariel will be freed
- 3. Prospero re-asserts his power
- 4. Ariel starts singing a freedom song, that hopefully it will give rise to forgetful slaves yearning for freedom
 - a. Prospero gives freedom, but he gives it contingently, not all the slaves are going to get freedom
- 5. Alonso says of caliban that he is the strangest creature
 - a. Emboldens prospero to see the difference, would back him in a fight with caliban

6. Gonzolo - prospero has tried everything but caliban hasnt conformed, suggests an exorcism, then suggests using corporal punishment

Caliban's Stand

1. In the end of the original caliban repents for stepping out of line, submits and restores order
2. Caesare - cailban refuses to repent
 - a. Caliban says that he has no regrets in revolving
 - b. Only regret is that he wasn't successful
 - c. Wants to spit out prospero's white magic which caused him to believe that he was inferior
3. Prospero - "the world is really upside down." Makes a plea on the basis of their "shared" culture
 - a. Inversion of the hierarchies
 - b. Suggests that they had worked side by side and build the island
 - c. Idea that caliban was nothing before prospero got there
4. Caliban refuses: will no longer accept Prospero's insults and wants to embrace his identity against the colonial one imposed on him
 - a. Embracing his identity, and refusing the subject position projected onto him
 - b. Tells prospero that none of the force he has will work
 - c. He will no longer hate himself, no longer under that spell

The Sorcerer Who No Longer Controls His Spell

1. Prospero - caliban is bridging about his own runin
 - a. Asserts his domination of nature, says that he can control these things, and he can control caliban
 - b. Now that caliban has resisted him, he is no longer going to return to europe
2. He is bewitched by his own spell - he cant define himself away from the slaves he is trying to dominate
 - a. Entire identity is caught up in the civilizing nature
 - b. Prospero cannot think of himself outside of his relationship with caliban
3. If he leaves and goes back to europe he no longer has any power there either
 - a. His mission is permanent and self-defeating
4. The others leave and it is just prospero and caliban
 - a. Prospero - he's tried to save Caliban repeatedly, who has "answered me with wrath and venom, like the opossum that pulls itself up by its own tail the better to bite the hand that tears it from the darkness."
 - b. Likens caliban to nature, possums - passive creatures that when they are afraid they roll over and play dead
 - c. Caliban has never showed any violence
5. Caliban knows who he is, but prospero is going though and identity crisis - has to fall back into defensive actions

Continuing Struggle

1. Jump forward in time
2. Island is overrun by possums.
3. The jungle is laying siege to the cave

4. Prospero is living in a cave, and the indigenous culture is running all around the island
5. He starts screaming at nature and shooting a gun at the passive possums
6. Indiscriminate violence is used against passive populations - like colonialism